



Protests and Media Representations: An Intersectional Analysis of the Marikana Massacre (2012), the Johannesburg Protests, and the Phoenix Massacre (2021)

Juliet Eileen Joseph¹ 

¹ Centre for African Diplomacy and Leadership (CADL), University of Johannesburg, South Africa.

ABSTRACT

This study contributes to the current body of knowledge that explores how the media creates stereotypes and influences gender parity in society. A vast amount of literature has been published on gender and the media, resulting in sufficient conceptual and theoretical frameworks. Using intersectional analysis, the study examines how media frames, focalizes and represents intersecting roles to shed light on afro-patriarchal frames, stereotypes, and representations. A qualitative analysis of two major events that occurred during South Africa's post-colonial period, the Marikana Massacre, the Phoenix Massacre which was accompanied by protests in parts of Johannesburg are presented in this study. The study findings highlight that these hallmark incidents in South African history are characterized by nationalistic, capitalist, and gendered discourses. As a result of the Marikana Massacre, the study suggests that the state insisted on pursuing its national interests at all costs, including using force and pushing agendas under the guise of increased nationalism and patriotism. In contrast, the study suggests that the state used limited force against looters and those who burned tyres and factories during the Phoenix Massacre. Moreover, dominant frames connected to state nationalism and upholding capitalism remain linked to intersectional differences in unequal societies.

Correspondence
Juliet Eileen Joseph
Email: jjoseph@uj.ac.za

Publication History
Received 22nd August, 2022
Accepted 14th December, 2023
Published online 8th February, 2023

Keywords: *Gender, Media, Intersectional Theory; Inequality, Nationalism, Post-colonial, Capitalism*

INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this article is to describe how the media contributes to stereotypes and influences gender parity in society. As a guide to the South African media and how they communicate stories, the article discusses the dominant media house, Black Star Group, formerly called Times Media Group. The second objective of this study is to explore different narratives about inequality in South Africa today. The intersectional analysis is used in this study to illuminate afro-patriarchal frames, stereotypes and representations through how the media frames, focalises and represents intersecting roles. South Africa's post-colonial context has been marked by two significant events, the Marikana Massacre and the Phoenix Massacre, both of which were accompanied by protests in various parts of the country,

including Gauteng are presented in this study. It is through these events that we can examine how nationalistic, capitalist, and gendered discourses are portrayed in South African history.

This article analyzes how the Biso Black Star Group (BBG), formerly named Times Media Group (TMG), depicted the Marikana Massacre considering that at the time, the Times Media Group was the most prominent media house with the Sunday Times being the most widely read newspaper in South Africa.

It has been noted that with privilege comes great power and authority.¹ This statement can be seen to be connected to the important role of the South African media in a post-apartheid context. The Sunday Times, one of the most popular newspapers published by the BBG was founded in 1906 and is currently circulated to other counties in the region such as Lesotho, Swaziland and Botswana. As such, this article will analyze how this media house TMG depicted intersectional frames on the 'Marikana Massacre' (2012).

In South Africa, Media 24 is the most prominent media house with the Daily Sun being the most widely read newspaper; therefore, the article will also analyze how this media house depicted the intersectional frames on the Phoenix Massacre and protests that occurred in parts of Johannesburg in 2021.

This study provides a brief synopsis of the massacres to contextualise these events. The Marikana Massacre was a hallmark event in South Africa's class divide context and focused on disgruntled miners who protested outside of the Lonmin Platinum mine in Marikana, Rustenburg because they wanted an increase in their wages.² In contrast, the Johannesburg protests and the Phoenix Massacre erupted under the Covid-19 pandemic, a day after the President of South Africa announced that the R350 Covid-19 grant for the unemployed would be halted. This again happened a day after the imprisonment of the former President of South Africa's Jacob Zuma.³ This event erupted before social discontent in parts of KwaZulu-Natal against former President Zuma's imprisonment and the looting that occurred in parts of Johannesburg and KwaZulu-Natal, where innocent people passing through areas in KwaZulu-Natal called Phoenix, were attacked.⁴

Background on the South African Media

The South African media moved from an apartheid-dominated and controlled system which ensured racial divide and the lack of promoting human rights to the vast majority, to one that has opened up more to the greater inclusivity of other players in this domain. According to Tomaselli, under the apartheid regime, the media was used as a tool to drive a controlled ideology promoting fear, inequality, oppression and exploitation. Wasserman asserts that since independence in 1994, South

¹ Christopher Robichaud, "With Great Power Comes Great Responsibility: On the Moral Duties of the Super-Powerful and Super-Heroic," in *Superheroes and Philosophy: Truth, Justice and the Socratic Way*, ed. T Morris and M Morris (Illinois: Open Court Publishing, 2005), 177–93.

² Crispin Chinguno, "Marikana and the Post-Apartheid Workplace Order" (Braamfontein, 2013), shorturl.at/cjTW8.

³ Des Erasmus and Lwazi Hlangu, "'Phoenix Massacre': What Really Happened in the Deadly Collision of Brutalised Communities," Daily Maverick, July 28, 2021, <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2021-07-28-phoenix-massacre-what-really-happened-in-the-deadly-collision-of-brutalised-communities/>; Nomahlubi Sonjica, "Jacob Zuma's Incarceration in July Brought Chaos to Parts of Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal," Sunday Times, January 1, 2022, <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-01-01-jacob-zumas-incarceration-in-july-brought-chaos-to-parts-of-gauteng-and-kwazulu-natal/>; Monica Laganparsad and Nomfundo Xolo, "South Africa: Past and Present Push Phoenix Over Edge," All Africa, July 29, 2021, <https://allafrica.com/stories/202108010153.html>.

⁴ Peace Kiguwa, "The House That Apartheid Built: What Room for Cohabitation?," *South African Journal of Psychology* 51, no. 4 (December 13, 2021): 481–84, <https://doi.org/10.1177/00812463211045633>; Juliet Eileen Joseph, "The South African Development Community (SADC) and Covid-19: Revisiting Security Community in SADC," *EUREKA: Social and Humanities*, no. 5 (September 30, 2021): 69–81, <https://doi.org/10.21303/2504-5571.2021.002047>; T R Carmichael, "Is Protest Action in South Africa Bringing Positive Change or Is It Threatening Our Human Right to Security?," *South African Journal of Bioethics and Law*, May 19, 2022, 4–5, <https://doi.org/10.7196/SAJBL.2022.v15i1.795>.

Africa has blossomed into a multi-party system with a constitution which promotes civil liberties such as freedom of the press and expression.⁵

However, Tomaselli argues that the legacies of the past are still in transformation and there is a need for reform within the domain of generalisation and representation which reinforce divide and inequality. This move has been demonstrated structurally and systematically.

Steenveld posits that the South African media was publicly criticised by former President Thabo Mbeki for their disagreement against the African National Congress (ANC) and persistent reinforcement of generalisation based on the past.⁶ This demonstrates that the media has been a victim of state surveillance,⁷ as has been suggested by London that allowing the ruling party control over shaping media content reduces public power.⁸ Notwithstanding that the idea of media freedom, democracy and nationalist discourses such as patriotism remains high on the media's radar with regard to their post-independence media reporting agenda.⁹

The Marikana incident demonstrated that South Africa has upheld their national interests at all expenses even by using force and driving the agenda for greater nationalism and patriotism simultaneously through conflict frames. Furthermore, the Phoenix Massacre demonstrates that national interests were upheld with the use of minimal force against civilians even though a nationalist and capitalist agenda still featured. In the aftermath of the Phoenix Massacre, national building frames were articulated specifically in the Indian community of Phoenix to evade ethnic conflict.

In both massacres, the media demonstrated African nationalist discourses, elitism, and patriotism and highlighted how contested events are centred on race, class and even gender.¹⁰ This can be seen to be connected to images which reflected a common identity connected to African black male and female South Africans and economic divides in South Africa. Under the Marikana Massacre, images of men featured more prominently as opposed to the Phoenix massacres which depicted women and children more significantly.¹¹

Under the Mbeki Administration, issues of class and ethnicity were brought into the spotlight, but in reality, classism did not form part of the discourse with which to be dealt by the state. The Phoenix Massacre further unpacked these intersecting oppressions, with racial, classist and ethnic divides connected to the Indian community in Phoenix and classism connected to the black mass population conflicts with this community. Coincidentally, the Phoenix Massacre suggested that the state aimed to uphold national interests through peaceful means and drove the agenda of nationalism and patriotism in the aftermath of the event.

Prominent South African media houses and media focalisation during the Marikana and Phoenix massacres. Tiso Black Star Group is predominantly owned by a board of African males (black and white) and has made a household name for itself due to its controversial newspaper, 'The Sunday Times', which is one of the harshest critics of state mismanagement and exposes secretive state issues (Times Media Group). The strategic goals of Times Media Group (TMG) are to 'enrich society with quality information, education, entertainment and creative ideas' (TimesMediaGroup). Under the

⁵ Herman Wasserman, "Political journalism in South Africa as a developing democracy—understanding media freedom and responsibility." *Communication: South African Journal for Communication Theory and Research*, 36(2), (2010): 240-251.

⁶ Herman Wasserman, "Globalized Values and Postcolonial Responses South African Perspectives on Normative Media Ethics." *International Communication Gazette*, 68(1), (2006): 71-91.

⁷ Pieter. J Fourie, *Media Studies: Media History, Media and Society*, vol. 1 (Cape Town: Juta and Company (Pty) Ltd, 2017).

⁸ London, "Frames How the Media Frames Political Issues," 2-3.

⁹ Wasserman, "Globalized Values and Postcolonial Responses South African Perspectives on Normative Media Ethics." 75-76.

¹⁰ Hart, "Rethinking the South African Crisis: Nationalism, Populism, Hegemony"; Sarah Day, Josephine Cornell, and Nick Malherbe, "Discourses of 'Service Delivery Protests' in South Africa: An Analysis of Talk Radio," *Critical Discourse Studies* 18, no. 2 (March 4, 2021): 245–62, <https://doi.org/10.1080/17405904.2019.1676279>; Joseph, "The South African Development Community (SADC) and Covid-19: Revisiting Security Community in SADC."

¹¹ Lorenzo Dalvit, "The Voice of the Voiceless? Decoloniality and Online Radical Discourses in South Africa," in *Decolonising Political Communication in Africa* (London: Routledge, 2021), 207–23, <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003111962-18>.

Marikana Massacre, Tiso Black Star Group used to be the biggest-selling weekly newspaper in 2012 in South Africa with a readership of 373,000, and 455 129 in distribution on Sunday mornings. During the Marikana period, this newspaper group sold newspapers such as the Sunday Times which was known as the throat-cutting edge South African journalism paper. At the time the paper cost just over R8.00 (1 US dollar) which the lower level Living Standards Measures (LSM) groups could not afford to buy. The catchphrase for the paper is centred on 'trust' and the 'paper for the people.' TMG has demonstrated time and again that its information is mainly gathered through the South African Police Services (SAPS).

The Daily Sun newspaper, a division of Naspers Group, has the largest daily paper with a readership of five (5) million (news24). The paper appeals to the mass population by covering sensational stories. This paper has created hype as the result of its sensational stories and affordable cost in comparison to other newspapers.¹²

The notion of focalisation can be said to focus on a specific perspective on an issue; it entails the subject position by the person creating the knowledge; in this instance, the South African Police Services (SAPS).¹³ Terminology connected to the *self* is always communicated as powerful and the other weak or the victim. The other can be seen to be demonstrated as a victim with a *weak* agency. In these instances, the state must always come across as more powerful, as the state cannot be reduced to victimhood which strips it of its perceived power.¹⁴

METHODOLOGY

The study was qualitative. Despite the extensive research in the academic, literature on media representations and gender equality there is little literature on massacres in a postcolonial context. The comparison of massacres that have taken place in South Africa over time has been relatively limited. Despite this, this study contributes to the limited knowledge both about the status of media representation in an intersectional society as well as in a post-liberation and democratic transition environment that requires further research.

To answer the questions and hypotheses, data collection and documentation were the main components of the study. To begin, an exploratory literature review was conducted, examining definitions, theories, viewpoints, principles, methods, and other research findings, as well as collecting newspaper articles from two prominent newspapers. In addition, secondary research was conducted using both primary and secondary sources. Newspaper articles that documented an eyewitness account of the massacres and protests were the primary sources used. Books, internet sources, and documents that contained descriptive articles and commentaries were the secondary sources used in this study. It is necessary to examine and assess how the media represents conflicts to ensure greater objectivity, and freedom of the press, to put forward prescriptions. For these changes to take effect, the current model needs to be reviewed.

Watershed Moments in South African history. The Context: Marikana Massacre

The Marikana Massacre occurred on 16 August 2012 at the Marikana plant of Lonmin PLC mines that produce platinum metals. The strike was the direct result of social discontent around labour and better housing disputes. This was an illegal and unprotected strike, and the strike was not represented by the National Union of Mine Workers (NUM) which is part of the biggest trade union in the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU).¹⁵ The ruling party, the African National Congress (ANC), formed part of this Tri-partite Alliance.

¹² DailySun.co.za.

¹³ Suman Gupta, "Conclusion: Media-Framing Analysis, One-Word Framing and 'Austerity,'" in *Media Representations of Anti-Austerity Protests in the EU*, ed. Tao Papaioannou and Suman Gupta (Routledge, 2018).

¹⁴ Papacharissi and Oliveira, "News Frames Terrorism: A Comparative Analysis of Frames Employed in Terrorism Coverage in U.S. and U.K. Newspapers."

¹⁵ Njabulo S. Ndebele, "Liberation Betrayed by Bloodshed," *Social Dynamics* 39, no. 1 (March 2013): 111, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02533952.2013.777558>.

Reportedly, there were 34-35 deaths as a result of hostility between the police and the miners.¹⁶ Before the event, two security workers and two policemen were killed as a result of strikes at the mine. Within this illegal strike, the miners carried traditional weapons such as 'pangas', 'spears,' and 'clubs' as their weaponry but they were not armed with firearms.¹⁷ The police employed ammunition and arms to end the uncontrollable and illegal strike. This protest is linked to several other protests as a result of social discontent by the poor and marginalized.

The Context: Phoenix Massacre and Johannesburg Protests

The July 2021 Johannesburg protests and the Phoenix Massacre that occurred in KwaZulu-Natal, following the imprisonment of the former president of South Africa, Jacob Zuma, illuminated notions of capitalism, nationalism, and intersectionality. The protestors articulated their radical voice using violence such as burning trucks, factories and looting shops. This can be seen to be connected to the infinity theory of social movements suggesting the "rich" world will have more social discontent; this can also be persistent in South Africa's unequal society.¹⁸ These highly organised protests highlight how protests have become radical, and this was articulated in the use of knob kiri's (African wooden clubs) by the protestors, the usage of petrol to burn factories and trucks and the mass looting of malls and shops within proximity of townships. These protests provided an existential hallmark in comparison to previous protests within disadvantaged black communities in South Africa and the prevailing inequality gap between the rich and the disadvantaged.

In contextualizing the massacres, the evening before the inception of the protests, President Cyril addressed the nation on the Covid-19 pandemic highlighting that South Africa would remain on lockdown Level 4 with restrictions such as no selling of alcohol and some businesses remaining closed, thus heavily impacting the economy. Seemingly, social discontent was incited as a result of the increase in poverty, inequality and pressure on a developing economy leading to the protests. Protestors burnt trucks, and factories and looted shops, thus impacting the supply chain through their mass mobilisation across the two provinces. These protests transpired into mass looting. At the inception of the Covid-19 pandemic in South Africa in 2020, the state developed a stimulus package to assist businesses and the poor financially with additional social grants during the tough economic times. This grant was not provided for the duration of the lockdown level 4 when the protests were ongoing but was reinstated again after the protests occurred. Some citizens were not happy about the lack of provision of this grant during this time. There was little support for this group of citizens that had no income nor other support for their livelihood during this time

Given this and in understanding the South African intersectional society, Broad Based Black Economic Empowerment (BBBEE) strategy, was published as a precursor to the B-BBEE Act, No. 53 of 2003. This Act aims at advancing economic transformation in the country and as a result, enhancing black people's economic participation in the economy of the country fundamentally. The BBBEE policy has delivered on its strategy to create a black capitalistic class or business elite to complement white capitalists in South Africa to ensure a consumer boom and economic development. Importantly, this type of equality remains flawed and is based on a small group of privileged black South Africans and not the individual identity alone. The majority of South Africans have not benefitted nor has poverty been reduced for the majority of black people in the region.

¹⁶ Asanda Benya, "The Invisible Hands: Women in Marikana," *Review of African Political Economy* 42, no. 146 (October 2, 2015): 545–60, <https://doi.org/10.1080/03056244.2015.1087394>.

¹⁷ Paul Sorensen, "The Marikana Tragedy," *International Journal of Environmental Studies* 69, no. 6 (December 2012): 871, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2012.734046>.

¹⁸ Séamus A. Power, "Why a Richer World Will Have More Civic Discontent: The Infinity Theory of Social Movements," *Review of General Psychology* 24, no. 2 (June 4, 2020): 118–33, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1089268020907326>.

DISCUSSION

In exploring media representations given the South African society, Michel Foucault in his book *Language, counter-memory, practice*, suggests that symbols such as those in the media help create the notion of reality.¹⁹ Furthermore, Jäger and Maier and Lai et al. also postulate that the media shapes realities; as a result, specific images and messages continue to be reinforced in society. In the South African context, images connected to notions of otherness, or the practice of othering are at play, given the socio-economic inequalities and divide which prevail between the rich and disadvantaged are evident in the media frames.²⁰

This line of thinking suggests the ‘watchdog’ role of the press remains integral in ensuring security for stakeholders by maintaining parameters that prevent the abuse of power and authority. Thus, intersectionality is a term that exists beyond femininity and masculinity. The existing differences are not only connected to gender oppression but also connected to exploitation, discrimination; and inequality across gender, race, class and ethnicity.²¹

Considering the above ideas, Beall proffers that the elite level of social order affects the emergence of greater equity due to the need for changes in the media environment.²² Hence, Beall, suggests the striking impact that partisan media has had on elite-political behaviour connected to a capitalist market-driven system that transpired as the result of privatisation, deregulation and elitist politics, a disadvantaged mass population, and a political elite middle-income group.²³

This study examined both the Marikana Massacre of 2012 and the Phoenix Massacre of 2021 through an analysis of newspaper clips. On one hand, the South African media communicated the state’s perspective of the Marikana Massacre and the main frames employed included conflict, responsibility and economic implications. On the other hand, under the Phoenix Massacre, the media employed frames employed that included conflict, human security and economic implications.

In expanding on this argument, global journalistic practice on representation and generalisation reinforces notions of ‘otherness’ through the creation of messages such as using words connected to the powerful versus the *weak*, which were reinforced within capitalistic terminology. In the case of the newspaper analyzed during this period, the categories that were used were linear categories that emanated from the state. Hence the state was the source of the category formations. Further to this, dialogical networks were created due to the presence of statements by the group of protesting miners’ legal representative advocates during the Marikana Massacre. This further ensured that the network frames were coordinated.²⁴

Moreover, it is apparent that the media frames communicated under the Marikana Massacre and Phoenix Massacres suggested notions of capitalism, nationalism and intersectionality. In further expounding on this, in the case of the Marikana Massacres, it was the mine workers who were disadvantaged black African mine workers. Whereas the Phoenix massacres were not about miners but instead started with some black African citizens looting malls within a close proximity of townships

¹⁹ Michel Foucault, *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1980).

²⁰ Michael Dear et al., “Seeing People Differently: The Sociospatial Construction of Disability,” *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 15, no. 4 (August 30, 1997): 455–80, <https://doi.org/10.1068/d150455>.

²¹ Agnes Richardson and Cynthia Loubier, “Intersectionality and Leadership.,” *International Journal of Leadership Studies* 3, no. 2 (2008): 142–61; Samantha Moore-Berg and Andrew Karpinski, “An Intersectional Approach to Understanding How Race and Social Class Affect Intergroup Processes.,” *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 13, no. 1 (2019): 12426; Dubravka Zarkov, “Exposures and Invisibilities: Media, Masculinities and the Narratives of Wars in an Intersectional Perspective,” in *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a Multi-Faceted Concept in Gender Studies* (Ashgate, 2011), 105–20.

²² Jo Beall, “Globalization and Social Exclusion in Cities: Framing the Debate with Lessons from Africa and Asia,” *Environment and Urbanization* 14, no. 1 (April 29, 2002): 44, <https://doi.org/10.1177/095624780201400104>.

²³ Denise Buiten and Kammila Naidoo, “Constructions and Representations of Masculinity in South Africa’s Tabloid Press: Reflections on Discursive Tensions in the *Sunday Sun*,” *Communicatio* 39, no. 2 (June 2013): 194–209, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02500167.2013.791333>.

²⁴ Jaakko Seikkula and Tom Erik Arnkil, *Dialogical Meetings in Social Networks.*, ed. Lynn Hoffman (Routledge, 2018).

and African communities. With the Phoenix Massacre, innocent people passing through Phoenix were attacked by the looters.

Simply put, the Marikana Massacre highlighted continued wage disputes with groups of miners who did not represent the usage of radical violence but instead demonstrated greater state power on the protesting miners, as the result of the police shooting of the crowd of miners with more lives being lost. Coincidentally, the media frames communicated under the Phoenix Massacre illuminated the move to mass social discontent articulating a mass radical voice through the use of violence such as burning trucks, and factories and looting shops. The Phoenix Massacre also suggested a highly organised series of events, highlighting how protests have become radical and articulated the use of knobkerries, a traditional wooden stick often used as a weapon, used by the protestors, the usage of petrol to burn factories and trucks and the mass looting of malls and shops within proximity of townships.

Both massacres seem to have certain commonalities that were demonstrated and include notions of intersectional oppressions that encompass discrimination, oppression, exploitation, and inequality across identity, gender, race, ethnicity and class.²⁵ The intersectional identities that were used by the looters encompassed the intersectional identities of oppression which exist beyond femininities and masculinities. The protestors under the Marikana Massacre were restricted to the notion of black mine workers often termed “cheap labour”, whereas the Phoenix Massacre can be seen to be connected to diverse intersectional oppressions that they challenged and is connected to post-colonial theory and the ramifications of colonialism such as capitalism as well as elitism and popular nationalism.

In remedying these intersecting challenges, Foucault concurs that citizens should be part of agenda setting process to determine an agenda without truths that are biased for multiple realities and greater objectivity to exist.²⁶ It has been repeatedly demonstrated that the South African press continues to articulate a bias towards the state as its main source or point of reference on an incident is the South African Police Service (SAPS), as is the case in the Marikana Massacre.²⁷

This study suggests that in recent years, the media have become more objective in their reportage and opened up diverse sources, as opposed to their previous modus operandi where they primarily used the SAPS as their source of information, even though the South African government articulates and represents conflict as distant from the state. Kotzé and Du Toit note that elites also aim at articulating increased levels of distance between themselves and the state to create an assumption about the conflict and the master narratives at play.²⁸

The progression in these two suggested stories suggests that, under the Marikana Massacre, the state only intervened through force to uphold the rule of law and ensure market fundamentalism. However, nine years later, the Phoenix Massacre suggests that the state intervened through the lack of force to uphold the rule of law and ensure market fundamentalism by peaceful means.²⁹ Police and the military were brought in after the Phoenix Massacre to do a post-massacre operation clean-up campaign. In addition, under the Marikana Massacre, discourses on African media manifestations were exclusionary of the marginalized African communities in the Marikana region.³⁰ However, with regards to the Phoenix Massacre, the media reported through their imagery, more on the intersecting representations of the disadvantaged and marginalized.

²⁵ Ashley J. Bohrer, *Marxism and Intersectionality* (Bielefeld: transcript publishing, 2019).

²⁶ Foucault, *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard.

²⁷ Laurenz A. Cornelissen et al., “A Computational Analysis of News Media Bias,” in *Proceedings of the South African Institute of Computer Scientists and Information Technologists 2019 on ZZZ - SAICSIT '19* (New York, New York, USA: ACM Press, 2019), 1–10, <https://doi.org/10.1145/3351108.3351134>.

²⁸ Hennie Kotzé and Pierre Du Toit, “The State, Civil Society, and Democratic Transition in South Africa,” *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 39, no. 1 (March 1, 1995): 27–48, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022002795039001002>.

²⁹ Kiguwa, “The House That Apartheid Built: What Room for Cohabitation?,”; Erasmus and Hlangu, “‘Phoenix Massacre’: What Really Happened in the Deadly Collision of Brutalised Communities,”

³⁰ Herman Wasserman, “Between the Local and the Global: South African Languages and the Internet,” *African and Asian Studies* 1, no. 4 (2002): 303–21, <https://doi.org/10.1163/156921002X00042>.

Upon reviewing the Marikana Massacre, the Phoenix Massacre, and the July 2021 protests in Johannesburg, this study emphasizes the possibility of transcending South Africa's transformation project. In general, strategies and plans that explore how oppressions and limitations have intersected and impacted society can allow a more inclusive, diversified and transformed kind of society to emerge, especially through media representation and articulation. In this intersectional study, a set of critical discourse analysis, framing, focalization and categorization theories are explored from the perspective offered.³¹ The three approaches are analyzed together for their relevance to the analysis of the dominant news texts (i.e. terminology used in factional journalism) and thus, how texts influence politics. As a result of this, Hall's media representation theory can be applied to pin down the actors, organizations, and behavior of the selected reports.³²

Additionally, the paper discusses through this analysis how the media communicated intersectional representations of both conflicts and power relationships between state and citizens during massacres and protests. Articles used in the study were published during and within five days of the massacre, and they specifically explore various narratives related to race, class, and gender that are embedded in the South African media trajectory to identify dominant representations, frames, and stereotypes.

The Relevance of Intersectional Analysis and How the Media Frame Massacres and Protests in Post-Colonial South Africa

The purpose behind intersectional research is to address inequalities which persist beyond female oppression, such as those surrounding race, class, and discrimination. This framework challenges socially constructed categories.³³ Lumby differentiates between three types of socially constructed categories, namely anti-categorical and intercategory complexity, which claim multiple and emerging categories reinforce discrimination, and intracategory complexity, which identifies what is categorised and what is not in control.³⁴ Due to the multiple interrelated oppressions existing in the South African context such as those related to race, class, ethnicity and gender among others, this framework has relevance. South Africa has overcome racial divides but economic divides remain, illustrating the relevance of intersectional theory. The issue can also be understood in relation to how the media represents mine workers as poor and marginalized, bearing in mind that media demonstrations are not equally objective or fair.³⁵

Essentially, it involves identifying frames of ideas and putting them together to construct a narrative. Therefore, the concept or idea is conveyed along with discourses that affirm certain concepts in a specific context.³⁶ Accordingly, frames are used to drive a political agenda that is based on nationalism and capitalist ideology.³⁷ They influence attitudes and decisions by defining the values, norms and beliefs that a group shares. The process of framing is built on questions and attitudes which create meaning that drives public policy and offers solutions to phrasing questions to demonstrate policy options and action options.³⁸ As a result, framing is a strategy for formulating meaning for

³¹ Dubravka Zarkov, 'Sex as usual: Body Politics and the Media War in Serbia', in Davis, K.(ed). *Embodied Practices*, (London: Sage, 1997), 110-127; Claes H. De Vreese, "News framing: Theory and typology." *Information design Journal & Document Design*, 13(1) (2005), 51-62; James Tankard, "The Empirical Approach to the Study of Media Framing," in *Framing Public Life* (Routledge, 2001), 111-21, <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410605689-12>.

³² Stuart Hall, *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*, (London: Sage,1997).

³³ Jacky Lumby, *Methodological Issues and Intersectionality in Gender*, 2011.

³⁴ Lumby, *Methodological Issues and Intersectionality in Gender*, 3.

³⁵ Ronald Weitzer, and Steven A. Tuch, "Racially biased policing: Determinants of citizen Perceptions." *Social Forces*, 83(3), (2005): 1009-1030.

³⁶ Claudia L. Menashe, "The Power of a Frame: An Analysis of Newspaper Coverage of Tobacco Issues-United States, 1985-1996," *Journal of Health Communication* 3, no. 4 (November 1998): 307-25, <https://doi.org/10.1080/108107398127139>; Claes H. de Vreese, "News Framing," *Information Design Journal* 13, no. 1 (April 18, 2005): 53, <https://doi.org/10.1075/idjdd.13.1.06vre>.

³⁷ de Vreese, "News Framing,"56.

³⁸ Zizi Papacharissi and Maria de Fatima Oliveira, "News Frames Terrorism: A Comparative Analysis of Frames Employed in Terrorism Coverage in U.S. and U.K. Newspapers," *The International Journal of Press/Politics* 13, no. 1 (January 1, 2008): 52-74, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161207312676>.

public policy and showing alternatives related to wording questions.

Issues framed play an important role in policy formation and are a function of the success and "opposition" frames created. Framing issues help steer public and political support. Menashe and Siegel imply that the main frames or debates must capture both political action options and political will.³⁹ To convey complex issues, the frames simplify complex ideas into simple terms. Frames also pay more attention to messages and expose the audience to agenda-setting based on a succession of events. Also, it has been shown that the more informed an individual is regarding a frame, the greater their set agenda. As a result, those who are already knowledgeable about the frame compare it with other set frames, which can weaken the familiar frames.⁴⁰

Frames must have linguistic and recognizable elements; be journalistic in method; be distinguishable from other frames, and must be representative. A frame refers to certain words, phrases, stereotypes, and aspects of information that create judgement.⁴¹ Furthermore, the characteristic of frames is accompanied by metaphors, examples, catchphrases, visual images, and illustrations. Specifically, media frames are communicated by using language that is similar to the language used in protests and massacres included in this study, such as massacre, lawlessness, murder, and uncontrollable violence.

According to the various types of frames. For the purpose of this study, the dominant frame, state retaliation against mine workers (Marikana Massacre) and the use of force against protestors and looters (Phoenix Massacre) is justified because these actors threaten the patriotism of the state, disrupt the dynamics of nationalism, and upset the power dynamics in the region. By relating events such as a massacre to frames, the word is given meaning. During the Marikana Massacre, several interconnected messages were communicated that included safeguarding the interests of the ruling elite, maintaining democracy, preventing unlawful behaviour, and ensuring there would be no immediate threat, all of which suggested military force would be used. Parallel to both massacres, the rhetoric emphasized intersecting oppression in the form of articulating criminal acts such as looting and the burning of tyres and factories, coupled with passive police force.

As Leudar et al. propose events are aligned based on the past, and can influence the future.⁴² The Marikana Massacre and previous mine protests are linked to the way specific events are framed in response to threats against the ruling elite. Hence, in the instance, Marikana Massacre frames are constructed that reflect class divides, which intersectionality attempts to overcome. In understanding the connection between media frames and intersectionality, not only are intersections of race and gender representation pertinent, but class also remains an intersecting challenge. Classism is a result of propaganda, rhetoric, and state loyalty. In demonstrating how class, race, and gender intersecting oppressions shape global media houses' reputation as producers of social practice within the media space, this article illustrates elitist dominance in the media. Through message construction within society, the media has legitimate authority and power.

The main theme of gender stereotyping after Marikana was that black men were weak, sly, and criminals. Since mining is not an elite occupation and the miners are not elite, they reinforce middle-class notions of 'us' versus 'them' and a sense of otherness. As an example, Moffet provides a theoretical correlation between apartheid narratives based on frantic, even aggressive principles of othering, and

³⁹ Claudia L. Menashe and Michael Siegel, "The Power of a Frame: An Analysis of Newspaper Coverage of Tobacco Issues-United States, 1985-1996," *Journal of Health Communication* 3, no. 4 (November 1998): 307-25, <https://doi.org/10.1080/108107398127139>.

⁴⁰ Dennis Chong and James N. Druckman, "A Theory of Framing and Opinion Formation in Competitive Elite Environments," *Journal of Communication* 57, no. 1 (March 2007): 99-118, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.2006.00331.x>.

⁴¹ Zhongdang Pan and Gerald Kosicki, "Framing Analysis: An Approach to News Discourse," *Political Communication* 10, no. 1 (1993): 55-75, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.1993.9962963>.

⁴² Ivan Leudar, Victoria Marsland, and Jiri Nekvapil, "On Membership Categorization: 'Us', 'Them' and 'Doing Violence' in Political Discourse," *Discourse & Society* 15, no. 2-3 (May 25, 2004): 243-66, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926504041019>.

the current climate of sexual violence in South Africa.⁴³ The process of political transformation in South Africa can be invigorated through the insight from sophisticated postcolonial studies of gender violence focussing on the role women's bodies and sexuality play in politics when nationalist, religious, and ethnic agendas are invoked during political transformation.⁴⁴

Among the stereotypes articulated after the Phoenix Massacre were those regarding disadvantaged families and communities and issues associated with intersectionalities, such as the race and class divide. Several frames showed how disadvantaged families looted shops for food even though looting is against the law. Thus, it was communicated as a historical loss frame based on past events and similar protests in the country. Also shown in the Marikana Massacre frames is the way the men are depicted as weak, vulnerable, and powerless. A series of suffering frames in the Phoenix Massacre conveys a sense of vulnerability and desperation.

Frames of histories of classism were demonstrated towards economic divides and opponents of the past and how elites prosper today. The news clips give reference to Cyril Ramaphosa, an apartheid freedom fighter turned business magnate in independent South Africa, who was affected and also the link to the power relations of the state at the time. The newspaper clips illustrate the tensions between the ruling elite and the poor masses by way of the moral frames espoused. As a politician turned businessman, Ramaphosa was prominent in the mining sector as he owned shares in the Lonmin Mining Group at the time of the Marikana Massacre. It is noteworthy that the Phoenix Massacre and protests in Johannesburg occurred during Ramaphosa's tenure as president.

Furthermore, the discourses used to revolve around conflicts such as alleged massacres. Mass discontent against the government is implied by these discourses. Media coverage demonstrated hierarchical structures within male structures, sexuality based on the bodies of marginalized black men (Marikana), marginalized intersections between diverse communities (Phoenix Massacre), and the domestic power politics between nationalistic ruling elites and poor masses.

The conflict surrounding the Marikana Massacre is framed with suspicion where it is communicated that the trade unions are absent from the scene and their lack of support for the strikes is highlighted, posing the question of whose interests they represent. Notably, leading up to the Phoenix massacre, there were Pro-Zuma protests against the imprisonment of the former President of South Africa Jacob Zuma who had been on a trial and was meant to be legally imprisoned at the time. In the aftermath of the Phoenix Massacre, Pro-Zuma protests that started before and leading up to the day before the Phoenix Massacre did not prevail during the massacre, even though it was alleged that some military veterans formed part of the group of people who participated in the Phoenix Massacre.⁴⁵ It clearly illustrates the role of the actors and the dynamics of political conflict within South Africa.

The framing perspective illustrates the histories elicited and the concerns of previous strikes and protests in South Africa. Therefore, other events in history have influenced how this event has played out. It is crucial to consider that the narratives are mainly from the perspective of the South African Police Services (SAPS) (under Marikana). In this respect, there is no conclusive evidence other than those stated caused the social unrest. A lot of expert advice focuses on statistics, but the viewpoints of miners are not voiced. This calls into question the objectivity of messages created for the public. In contrast, diverse sources gave accounts of what happened as part of the Phoenix Massacre. Although the death statistics reported to the public came directly from state agencies, many of those who died were said to have been found during the clean-up campaign after the Johannesburg protests and the Phoenix massacre. As a result, either mass looting or police shootings caused the deaths, but the cause of death was not confirmed.

⁴³ Helen Moffett, "'These Women, They Force Us to Rape Them': Rape as Narrative of Social Control in Post-Apartheid South Africa," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 32, no. 1 (March 2006): 157. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057070500493845>.

⁴⁴ Moffett, "'These Women, They Force Us to Rape Them': Rape as Narrative of Social Control in Post-Apartheid South Africa," ; Mel De Neloufer, *Women and the Nation's Narrative* (Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2001).

⁴⁵ Anna Maree, "South Africa: Who Is behind the pro-Zuma ANC Military 'Veterans'?", March 25, 2021, <https://www.theafricareport.com/73846/south-africa-who-is-behind-the-pro-zuma-anc-military-veterans/>.

Violence and conflict are framed as normal and interchangeable throughout time and space by the discourses employed. News clips indicate that there are strings of events interconnected here. Clearly demonstrated are gender hierarchies based on masculinity and femininity, classism, caste systems, sexuality, and geopolitics and power relations within cultures. As a result of the Marikana Massacre, the perspective of the state and elites is articulated, but marginalized people are not included in the information flow. Using diverse intersectional methods, the Phoenix Massacre is examined from the perspectives of the SAPS, the community and the looters, but not those of the looters. Since the dominant frame remained one of the states, it was difficult to pin down why the Phoenix Massacre occurred.

There are two generic frames: those concerned with the politics of elitist regimes and those concerned with patrimonial politics. This focus on strategic news concerns stories around winning and losing, language on war and competition interests, opponents and the self, and perceptions.⁴⁶ Episodic frames in the clips are based on social issues related to events. Thematic frames in the clip are based on broader interpretations or context. This means that framing simplifies complex issues in a manner that is easily understood. Hence, the frames are based on ‘human impact, powerlessness, economic, moral values’ and ‘conflict.’ In addition, it is based on the descriptions of powerful and powerless frames, the powerful who dominate over the weak.

During both instances, the media demonstrated the miners (Marikana) and looters (Phoenix Massacre) as individuals responsible for their weakness, focusing on their disadvantage and economic inequality. Attributed to that was the need for higher salaries and this can be termed episodic. On the contrary, if the clips were framed from the perspective of the ruling elite who are in the opposition viewing these stories on poverty, it would be termed thematic. The thematic views in Marikana would be in the position to contribute to solutions connected to policy and lobbying which the victim was unable to be part of shaping.⁴⁷ This raises a very important aspect within this domain and informs the purpose of the study.

The economic frames related to ‘the profit’ and ‘losses of the mines and economy (Marikana) and the burning of factories, trucks and mass looting (Phoenix Massacre), impacting the capitalist system also form part of the framing process. The moral frames refer to morality and social approval, in this instance, the upholding of the law. The conflict frame refers to winners (state), losers (miners and looters) and competitors (elite).⁴⁸

Semetko and Valkenburg and de Vreese identified five new frames namely ‘conflict’, ‘human interest’, ‘attribution or responsibility’, ‘morality’ and ‘economic consequences.’⁴⁹ The newspaper clips employed frame conflict, and an account should be given by the elite for a resolution and justify the reasons for intervention based on economic outcomes. The conflict frames identified are among the state institutions, mining companies (Marikana), businesses (Phoenix) and individuals (miners). It is a direct demonstration of the division of labour in capitalistic states as the result of inequality in the economy.⁵⁰ The morality frame gives account for the moral grounds for action as noted by the police was to ensure democracy, peace and upholding the rule of law during the Marikana Massacre, and to prevent the loss of life under the Phoenix Massacre.⁵¹

With specific reference to the Marikana Massacre, news about the massacres was only aired during the period that the massacre occurred and in the aftermath of the massacre. Firstly, the headlines demonstrated allegations of collusion between the state and elitist mine owners. There was also the denial of a conspiracy from the mine owners taking defence and the state remaining neutral. Secondly,

⁴⁶ Kathleen Hall Jamieson, *Dirty Politics: Deception, Distraction, and Democracy* (Oxford University Press, 1992).

⁴⁷ Scott London, “Frames How the Media Frames Political Issues,” *Kettering Foundation*, 1993.

⁴⁸ Guus Bartholomé, Sophie Lecheler, and Claes de Vreese, “Towards A Typology of Conflict Frames,” *Journalism Studies* 19, no. 12 (September 10, 2018): 1689–1711, <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1299033>.

⁴⁹ Holli A. Semetko and Patti M. Valkenburg Valkenburg, “Framing European Politics: A Content Analysis of Press and Television News,” *Journal of Communication* 50, no. 2 (June 1, 2000): 93–109, <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.2000.tb02843.x>; de Vreese, “News Framing,” 56.

⁵⁰ Surinder S. Jodhka, Boike Rehbein, and Jessé Souza, *Inequality in Capitalist Societies*, 1st ed. (Routledge, 2018).

⁵¹ de Vreese, “News Framing,” 56.

newspaper clips demonstrate the police who as the powerful, are armed with weapons and have dominion over the mine workers who are lying on the ground like criminals or thieves.

The newspaper clips used words such as ‘bodies’ and ‘dead bodies’, so this frames the clips demonstrating that police ensure rule of law and justice versus the mine workers who are assumed to be their opposite, the unlawful and the villains. The source selection uses direct quotes from the elitist mining group Lonmin and the mine workers' representative Advocate Dali Mpofu. The allegations were drawn on colluding between the state department of natural resources, police and elitists and the premeditated murder of miners. Quotes such as ‘toxic collusion between state and elitists.’ and ‘murder and extra-judicial killing’ demonstrate underlying media frames on how elitists are favoured, and their interests are aligned with those of the state.

Lexical words such as collusion, capitalists, murder and judicial killing highlight how conflict is framed. The only visible logos and imagery are those of the police uniform worn in the picture and police badges reinforcing the dominance of the state and martyrdom in their actions taken to secure the state's national interests.

The statistics in the text include the date of the event and allegations such as an e-mail which was sent by Cyril Ramaphosa for the matter to be dealt with by the police stating the criminality of this event. This highlights another frame on how the matter has been criminalised.

In the proceeding days, in the news articles, the event statistics were consistent in every report, stating that thirty-four (34) miners were killed, and seventy-eight (78) wounded; they carried knobkerries, sticks and rods. In addition, two policemen and two security men were also murdered a few days before the event.⁵² Hence this event is linked to previous events or incidents.

Thus, the subject in these newspaper articles, initially, is the Lonmin and state defence to alleged e-mails, whereas the object is the Marikana incident. The article is focalised on domestic perspectives of social discontent by the public and workers within the state on salary and wage disputes between private companies and how the state intervenes in this instance. The state's role is to ensure rule of law and intervention. The text demonstrated citizenship issues of the public and how state power is dominant, as the trade unions do not even feature. This can be seen to be connected to economic and capitalist perspectives that are focalized, as being the dominant behaviour concerning how the state operated, with social discontent towards the state being demonstrated through protests such as in the case of the Marikana massacre and Johannesburg protests. The article also outlines the relationship between the elitist groups, former freedom fighters turned business people, and state relations. Inevitably, the ruling elite control the state and economic interests and a capitalist system remains key for the state.

The generic frames employed include conflict frames (‘Marikana massacre’) economic frames (capitalism and labour disputes) and responsibility frames (reference given to colluding between state and elitists). However, the frames demonstrate that the elites are in the account of abuse power if depicted throughout. Moreover, the state is framed as dominant, upholding rule of law and capitalistic driven; the suspects involved in planning this were the elitists as the result of the language used; the people injured were the miners who are also framed as criminals and against the rule of law (source). The notion of words such as ‘South African history’ implies contention in the ruling elitist system and flaws which are beginning to be exposed, to some extent. However, the words ‘police ignorance’ demonstrate that institutional and capacity challenges within the state prevail.

⁵² SAPA. 2012. Marikana inquiry updates. [Online] Available at: <<http://www.timeslive.co.za/local/2012/10/24/marikana-inquiry-updates-24-october-2012>>[Accessed 5th June 2013]; SAPA. 2012. Lonmin defends e-mails with government over Marikana. [Online] Available at: <<http://www.timeslive.co.za/>> [Accessed 5th June 2013].

Analysis: The Times Media Newspaper clips

Time Media Group newspaper clippings examined in the study on the Marikana Massacre include *Ramaphosa Exposed*, *Miner's Slain like Vermin*, and *Lonmin defends e-mails with the government over Marikana* and *Marikana inquiry updates*.⁵³

In Times Media Group (Black Star Group) clips, the story was initially told from the perspective of the state and in the proceeding articles, the mine workers' representative blames Lonmin mines elitists. The perspective frames police challenges in certain structures and not the police force as a whole. In other clips, the perspective of the family members of the dead mine workers and also the perspectives of the families of the murdered two security guards are communicated. This criminalises the miners and still does not give the perspective of the miners who were involved. The miners are portrayed as victims and the state as strong, powerful, intervening and maintaining order. The security guards who were murdered before the Marikana Massacre were named in the document to create special attention to what instigated police action.

This demonstrates the ideologies and agendas being driven. The state is represented as a supreme power that intervened in the incident and places the blame on police capacity challenges. Lonmin mines and the mine workers are illustrated as criminals against the rule of law. The agenda that have been driven are centred on conflict and the perspective of the poor and marginalized was not communicated. None of the messages has discussed the reasons for the discontent, as these impact on social security of the public such as poverty and inequality in this text specifically, hence the lack of demonstrating intersectional frames within classism. These stories are focalised along the line of the subject being the families and the object being the killings or dead bodies.

Therefore, the language demonstrated is focused on police mismanagement and weak police coordination. The text communicates that this entailed a few officers and was inevitably overcome by the bulk of police who upheld the rule of law. The articles also highlight that the miners were unarmed and had traditional weaponry demonstrating the use of force by the state at all costs to ensure capitalistic interests and socio-economic challenges within the domestic politics of the state. This perhaps highlights the state's focus on market fundamentalism at the expense of social development and welfare. This is also linked to the international division of labour interests as Lonmin is vastly owned by international investors, hence the local global link in the political arena.

The focalised perspective which is prominent is based on intersectional differences which exist within the state and the lack of policy to address this serious matter. In this instance, elitist regimes based on privilege and patrimonial politics creates division and increased inequalities between the rich and poor. In addition, these divisions do not favour the poor.

The two words that were used throughout the articles included 'Marikana' and 'Lonmin.' The main perspectives or expert advice given was from the SAPS in the Media Group articles, the National Union of Mines (NUM) advocate, Lonmin mine management and the government. There were no mine workers' perspectives quoted at any point. The main two sources were the police and the Lonmin mining group. The main frames employed include the people who are the dead bodies, and the injured, the police who include the force, law enforcers, investigators and the suspects who are the elitists such as Cyril Ramaphosa. The frames were episodic and occurred in the same way that protests occur; in this context, there had been a string of other social discontent strikes and events by the public at large.

The media terms the event the 'Marikana Massacre' which reveals power relations within the state and gives reference to 'unlawful behaviour,' and a threat to the state. This criminalises this event but justifies the event on the part of police retaliation. State force was employed and multiple realities such as the miner's viewpoints were not explored. Western stereotypes and generalisations which were employed included black men being portrayed as criminals, lawbreakers and sly. These were reinstated in these articles.

The representation of the Marikana incident as a massacre demonstrates how the media frames conflict in South African society and the power relations which reside within this context. The

⁵³ SAPA. 2012. Marikana inquiry updates. SAPA. 2012. Lonmin defends e-mails with government over Marikana.

descriptive language used included underlying metaphors such as ‘massacre, killed, dead bodies.’ The word massacre was only used in the first articles thereafter less often. In a sense, this justified the actions of the police, rule of law and there was no real blame given to the police for upholding the law even through the use of force.

The frames employed were also thematic in nature and were based on the self-defence of the police, violent miners, and economic threats to the state. Capitalism plays a role in media frames and the media industry as a whole as higher-income earners are often the ones who are not excluded from information flow accessibility.

An Analysis of the Marikana and Phoenix Massacres

Both massacres depicted the ramifications of “wealth, political culture and repression which has manifested in post-apartheid South Africa”.⁵⁴ This is a clear demonstration of progressive movements of the disadvantaged who challenged the marginalisation of the poor by the state. This is because the state lacks development for the marginalized who have shown discontent due to prevailing human security threats which threaten their livelihoods such as unemployment, poverty and lack of access to education and income.

Under the Marikana Massacre, the newspaper clips were focalised as the police were merely responding as the result of panic stemming from the lack of control, thus jeopardising the rule of law and justice requiring the use of force. Therefore, the dominant frame is that of the police and not miners or elites. The Phoenix Massacre newspaper clips focalised the police responding to the crimes that were being committed through the burning of trucks, and factories, and the looting of malls with passive force.

During the Marikana Massacre, there was no deeper reason for the killing of the two policemen or security guards, just an underlying assumption that the miners were unruly and uncontrollable. The Phoenix Massacre highlighted the continued looting that prevailed, even whilst police were present, amidst minimal police presence. It was only after the massacre that the military supported the police in collecting stolen goods that were looted during the massacre. Looters were framed for the crimes they committed as unruly and uncontrollable.

The texts connected to both massacres do not explain why this behaviour occurred or what caused these events in both instances. Coincidentally, the frames identified for both massacres suggest the actions taken by the state are justified in response to a security threat, overcoming violence and securing national interests and market fundamentalism. One important aspect worth highlighting concerning the Phoenix Massacre suggests the lack of an increased police force as was the case under the Marikana Massacre in a bid to prevent the loss of life by the police. Notably, in both instances, this reinforced the frames that are based on capitalist stances which propagated the involvement, suggesting the police action was reactionary and validated the course of action or manner in which events occurred.

It was the Police Commission that communicated the accountability of the state can also be reduced to martyrdom as their priority is linked to femininities and masculinities.⁵⁵ In addition, the diplomatic and military policy was evident as well as how localised events are demonstrated against the globalised events for policy solutions. This is used for future connections between national identity, public expectation from the press and public opinion, and press coverage. The differences are explained by government policy, institutional tendency and dominant journalism paradigm within the state.⁵⁶

This suggests and identifies a symbiotic relationship between policy and press and the influence by all state actors, local and international is both mutual and simultaneous. Furthermore, the policy solution is gained through the way the government advocates and gains prominence as exclusivity is

⁵⁴ Ndebele, “Liberation Betrayed by Bloodshed,”113.

⁵⁵ Zarkov, ‘Sex as usual: Body Politics and the Media War in Serbia’,110-127.

⁵⁶ Papacharissi and Oliveira, “News Frames Terrorism: A Comparative Analysis of Frames Employed in Terrorism Coverage in U.S. and U.K. Newspapers.”

demonstrated as the media promotes a particular perspective that includes the main players and can exclude others.⁵⁷

The focalisation methods used under the Marikana Massacre was therefore not from the perspective of the striking mine workers but from that of the police, as the South African Police Services (SAPS) was the main source of information during this time. The perspective of the miners involved was not communicated at any point. This alone questioned the objectivity of the media under the Marikana Massacre. Therefore, the focus was on state national interests as well as the divide between the rich (elite mine owners) and the poor (miners) and how the marginalized continue to lack economic freedom. The voice of the disadvantaged miners was not communicated at any point.

However, during the Phoenix Massacre, diverse perspectives connected to intersecting oppressions faced by people of colour across race, class and gender were demonstrated in the manner in which men, women, children, grandparents and different people in the family structure looted malls. Hence, through the images articulated diverse intersecting individual oppressions were communicated. One of the most popular media clips that went viral during the Phoenix Massacre was when the BBC even captured a baby being thrown from a burning apartment, connected to the looting. This image spoke to the citizenship of the community's reaction to the looting. In many instances, communities attempted to protect their localities against further looting, highlighting how communities themselves have taken on the role of good citizens or that of protecting their national interests against threats.

In further exploring the politics of the massacres, power relations and geopolitics of the region are central focus in the article with a message on the continued vulnerability of the Tripartite Alliance, power issues between the African National Congress which is the ruling party and trade unions. Ndebele argues that in the instance of Marikana, the fundamental difference is that the mine workers who were shot in Marikana were from the Association of Mine Workers and Construction Union (AMCU) and not COSATU or the Tripartite Alliance. They were, however, a separate union and at the entry zone of mainstreaming the Tripartite Alliance at the time.⁵⁸ Ndebele goes on to add that the miner workers would not have been shot at had their interest in the protest been part of the interests of the ANC.⁵⁹ This highlights an important point of the politics of privilege in South Africa. The Phoenix Massacre can also be seen to be connected to the Pro-Zuma faction within the ANC, as the protests initially started as the result of the former Jacob Zuma's imprisonment for his contempt of court. Additionally, there was speculation about the Phoenix Massacre being connected to insurgency. This calls for a strong case of fairness for affiliates and non-affiliates in the promotion of law and upholding the rule of law.

CONCLUSION

The paper has explored the idea of privilege and disadvantage using intersectional theory to depict media representations in post-colonial South Africa's massacres. The article explored prominent media houses during the Marikana Massacre and the Phoenix Massacre, demonstrating how intersecting oppressions are communicated under conflict. This link between the media and the public demonstrated the politics of the state and how inequality and a lack of consensus within the rich-poor divide prevail in South Africa. The Marikana incident demonstrated that the state has upheld its national interests at all expenses even by using force and driven agendas on greater nationalism and patriotism simultaneously through conflict frames. Coincidentally, the use of force was under much scrutiny under the Phoenix Massacre and hence limited the usage of force by the state on looters and those that burnt tyres and factories. This was through images which ensure a common identity.⁶⁰ The article suggests that under the Phoenix Massacre issues of class and ethnicity were brought into the spotlight, but in reality, classism did not form part of a discourse to be dealt with by the state

⁵⁷ Maaikje Meijer, "Countering Textual Violence," *Women's Studies International Forum* 16, no. 4 (July 1993): 367-78, [https://doi.org/10.1016/0277-5395\(93\)90028-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0277-5395(93)90028-8).

⁵⁸ Ndebele, "Liberation Betrayed by Bloodshed," 113.

⁵⁹ Ndebele, "Liberation Betrayed by Bloodshed," 113.

⁶⁰ Wasserman, "Globalized Values and Postcolonial Responses South African Perspectives on Normative Media Ethics." 78-79.

notwithstanding that dominant frames connected to state nationalism, upholding capitalism connected to an intersectional difference in an unequal society remained.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Bartholomé, Guus, Sophie Lecheler, and Claes de Vreese. "Towards A Typology of Conflict Frames." *Journalism Studies* 19, no. 12 (September 10, 2018): 1689–1711. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1299033>.
- Beall, Jo. "Globalization and Social Exclusion in Cities: Framing the Debate with Lessons from Africa and Asia." *Environment and Urbanization* 14, no. 1 (April 29, 2002): 41–51. <https://doi.org/10.1177/095624780201400104>.
- Benya, Asanda. "The Invisible Hands: Women in Marikana." *Review of African Political Economy* 42, no. 146 (October 2, 2015): 545–60. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03056244.2015.1087394>.
- Bohrer, Ashley J. *Marxism and Intersectionality*. Bielefeld: transcript publishing, 2019.
- Buiten, Denise, and Kammila Naidoo. "Constructions and Representations of Masculinity in South Africa's Tabloid Press: Reflections on Discursive Tensions in the *Sunday Sun*." *Communicatio* 39, no. 2 (June 2013): 194–209. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02500167.2013.791333>.
- Carmichael, T R. "Is Protest Action in South Africa Bringing Positive Change or Is It Threatening Our Human Right to Security?" *South African Journal of Bioethics and Law*, May 19, 2022, 4–5. <https://doi.org/10.7196/SAJBL.2022.v15i1.795>.
- Chinguno, Crispin. "Marikana and the Post-Apartheid Workplace Order." Braamfontein, 2013. shorturl.at/cjTW8.
- Chong, Dennis, and James N. Druckman. "A Theory of Framing and Opinion Formation in Competitive Elite Environments." *Journal of Communication* 57, no. 1 (March 2007): 99–118. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.2006.00331.x>.
- Cornelissen, Laurenz A., Lucia I. Daly, Qhama Sinandile, Heinrich de Lange, and Richard J. Barnett. "A Computational Analysis of News Media Bias." In *Proceedings of the South African Institute of Computer Scientists and Information Technologists 2019 on ZZZ - SAICSIT '19*, 1–10. New York, New York, USA: ACM Press, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3351108.3351134>.
- Dalvit, Lorenzo. "The Voice of the Voiceless? Decoloniality and Online Radical Discourses in South Africa." In *Decolonising Political Communication in Africa*, 207–23. London: Routledge, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003111962-18>.
- Dawson, Ashley. "Documenting Democratization: New Media Practices in Post-Apartheid South Africa." In *Media in Transition Conference*. Massachusetts: MIT, 1999. <https://web.mit.edu/m-l-t/articles/dawson.html>.
- Day, Sarah, Josephine Cornell, and Nick Malherbe. "Discourses of 'Service Delivery Protests' in South Africa: An Analysis of Talk Radio." *Critical Discourse Studies* 18, no. 2 (March 4, 2021): 245–62. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17405904.2019.1676279>.
- Dear, Michael, Robert Wilton, Sharon Lord Gaber, and Lois Takahashi. "Seeing People Differently: The Sociospatial Construction of Disability." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 15, no. 4 (August 30, 1997): 455–80. <https://doi.org/10.1068/d150455>.
- Erasmus, Des, and Lwazi Hlangu. "'Phoenix Massacre': What Really Happened in the Deadly Collision of Brutalised Communities." *Daily Maverick*, July 28, 2021. <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2021-07-28-phoenix-massacre-what-really-happened-in-the-deadly-collision-of-brutalised-communities/>.
- Foucault, Michel. *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*. Edited by Donald F. Bouchard. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1980.
- Fourie, Pieter. J. *Media Studies: Media History, Media and Society*. Vol. 1. Cape Town: Juta and Company (Pty) Ltd, 2017.
- Gupta, Suman. "Conclusion: Media-Framing Analysis, One-Word Framing and 'Austerity.'" In *Media Representations of Anti-Austerity Protests in the EU*, edited by Tao Papaioannou and Suman Gupta. Routledge, 2018.

- Hart, Gillian. "Rethinking the South African Crisis: Nationalism, Populism, Hegemony." *Antidope: A Radical Journal of Geography* 20 (2014): 1–8. https://antipodeonline.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/book-review_satgar-on-hart.pdf.
- Jacobs, Sean Henry. "Public Sphere, Power and Democratic Politics : Media and Policy Debates in Post-Apartheid South Africa." Birkbeck (University of London), 2004.
- Jamieson, Kathleen Hall. *Dirty Politics: Deception, Distraction, and Democracy*. Oxford University Press, 1992.
- Joseph, Juliet Eileen. "The South African Development Community (SADC) and Covid-19: Revisiting Security Community in SADC." *EUREKA: Social and Humanities*, no. 5 (September 30, 2021): 69–81. <https://doi.org/10.21303/2504-5571.2021.002047>.
- Kiguwa, Peace. "The House That Apartheid Built: What Room for Cohabitation?" *South African Journal of Psychology* 51, no. 4 (December 13, 2021): 481–84. <https://doi.org/10.1177/00812463211045633>.
- Kotzé, Hennie, and Pierre Du Toit. "The State, Civil Society, and Democratic Transition in South Africa." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 39, no. 1 (March 1, 1995): 27–48. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022002795039001002>.
- Laganparsad, Monica, and Nomfundo Xolo. "South Africa: Past and Present Push Phoenix Over Edge." *All Africa*, July 29, 2021. <https://allafrica.com/stories/202108010153.html>.
- Lai, Wing Tung, Cheuk Wun Chung, and Nga Sze Po. "How Do Media Shape Perceptions of Social Reality? A Review on Cultivation Theory." *Journal of Communication and Education* 2, no. 2 (2015): 8–17.
- Leudar, Ivan, Victoria Marsland, and Jiri Nekvapil. "On Membership Categorization: 'Us', 'Them' and 'Doing Violence' in Political Discourse." *Discourse & Society* 15, no. 2–3 (May 25, 2004): 243–66. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926504041019>.
- London, Scott. "Frames How the Media Frames Political Issues." *Kettering Foundation*, 1993.
- Lumby, Jacky. *Methodological Issues and Intersectionality in Gender*, 2011.
- Maree, Anna. "South Africa: Who Is behind the pro-Zuma ANC Military 'Veterans'?" March 25, 2021. <https://www.theafricareport.com/73846/south-africa-who-is-behind-the-pro-zuma-anc-military-veterans/>.
- Marinovich, Greg. *Murder at Small Koppie : The Real Story of South Africa's Marikana Massacre*. NY: Penguin Random House, 2016. <https://msupress.org/9781611862768/murder-at-small-koppie>.
- Meijer, Maaïke. "Countering Textual Violence." *Women's Studies International Forum* 16, no. 4 (July 1993): 367–78. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0277-5395\(93\)90028-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0277-5395(93)90028-8).
- Menashe, Claudia L. "The Power of a Frame: An Analysis of Newspaper Coverage of Tobacco Issues-United States, 1985-1996." *Journal of Health Communication* 3, no. 4 (November 1998): 307–25. <https://doi.org/10.1080/108107398127139>.
- Menashe, Claudia L., and Michael Siegel. "The Power of a Frame: An Analysis of Newspaper Coverage of Tobacco Issues-United States, 1985-1996." *Journal of Health Communication* 3, no. 4 (November 1998): 307–25. <https://doi.org/10.1080/108107398127139>.
- Moffett, Helen. "'These Women, They Force Us to Rape Them': Rape as Narrative of Social Control in Post-Apartheid South Africa." *Journal of Southern African Studies* 32, no. 1 (March 2006): 129–44. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057070500493845>.
- Moore-Berg, Samantha, and Andrew Karpinski. "An Intersectional Approach to Understanding How Race and Social Class Affect Intergroup Processes. ." *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 13, no. 1 (2019): 12426.
- Ndebele, Njabulo S. "Liberation Betrayed by Bloodshed." *Social Dynamics* 39, no. 1 (March 2013): 111–14. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02533952.2013.777558>.
- Neloufer, Mel De. *Women and the Nation's Narrative*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 2001.
- Nkomo, Sibusiso, and Anthony Wafula. "AD85: Strong Public Support for 'Watchdog' Role Backs African News Media under Attack," May 3, 2016.

- Odine, Maurice. "Media Coverage of Conflict in Africa." *Global Media Journal-African Edition* 7, no. 2 (2013): 201–25.
- Pan, Zhongdang, and Gerald Kosicki. "Framing Analysis: An Approach to News Discourse." *Political Communication* 10, no. 1 (1993): 55–75.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.1993.9962963>.
- Papacharissi, Zizi, and Maria de Fatima Oliveira. "News Frames Terrorism: A Comparative Analysis of Frames Employed in Terrorism Coverage in U.S. and U.K. Newspapers." *The International Journal of Press/Politics* 13, no. 1 (January 1, 2008): 52–74.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161207312676>.
- Power, Séamus A. "Why a Richer World Will Have More Civic Discontent: The Infinity Theory of Social Movements." *Review of General Psychology* 24, no. 2 (June 4, 2020): 118–33.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1089268020907326>.
- Richardson, Agnes, and Cynthia Loubier. "Intersectionality and Leadership. ." *International Journal of Leadership Studies* 3, no. 2 (2008): 142–61.
- Robichaud, Christopher. "With Great Power Comes Great Responsibility: On the Moral Duties of the Super-Powerful and Super-Heroic." In *Superheroes and Philosophy: Truth, Justice and the Socratic Way*, edited by T Morris and M Morris, 177–93. Illinois: Open Court Publishing, 2005.
- SAPA. 2012. Lonmin defends e-mails with government over Marikana. [Online] Available at: <http://www.timeslive.co.za/> [Accessed 5th June 2013].
- SAPA. 2012. Marikana inquiry updates. [Online] Available at: <http://www.timeslive.co.za/local/2012/10/24/marikana-inquiry-updates-24-october-2012> [Accessed 5th June 2013].
- Seikkula, Jaakko, and Tom Erik Arnkil. *Dialogical Meetings in Social Networks*. . Edited by Lynn Hoffman. Routledge, 2018.
- Semetko, Holli A., and Patti M. Valkenburg Valkenburg. "Framing European Politics: A Content Analysis of Press and Television News." *Journal of Communication* 50, no. 2 (June 1, 2000): 93–109. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1460-2466.2000.tb02843.x>.
- Siegfried, Jäger, and Florentine Maier. "Theoretical and Methodological Aspects of Foucauldian Critical Discourse Analysis and Dispositive Analysis." In *Critical Discourse Analysis*, edited by Ruth Wodak, 4:1165–1165. London: Sage Publications Ltd, 2013.
- Sonjica, Nomahlubi. "Jacob Zuma's Incarceration in July Brought Chaos to Parts of Gauteng and KwaZulu-Natal." Sunday Times, January 1, 2022. <https://www.timeslive.co.za/news/south-africa/2022-01-01-jacob-zumas-incarceration-in-july-brought-chaos-to-parts-of-gauteng-and-kwazulu-natal/>.
- Sorensen, Paul. "The Marikana Tragedy." *International Journal of Environmental Studies* 69, no. 6 (December 2012): 871–73. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00207233.2012.734046>.
- Surinder S. Jodhka, Boike Rehbein, and Jessé Souza. *Inequality in Capitalist Societies*. 1st ed. Routledge, 2018.
- Tankard, James. "The Empirical Approach to the Study of Media Framing." In *Framing Public Life*, 111–21. Routledge, 2001. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781410605689-12>.
- Tomaselli, Keyan. "Ownership and Control in the South African Print Media: Black Empowerment after Apartheid, 1990–1997." *Ecquid Novi: African Journalism Studies* 18, no. 1 (January 1997): 67–68. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02560054.1997.9653194>.
- Vreese, Claes H. "News Framing." *Information Design Journal* 13, no. 1 (April 18, 2005): 51–62. <https://doi.org/10.1075/idjdd.13.1.06vre>.
- Wasserman, Herman. "Between the Local and the Global: South African Languages and the Internet." *African and Asian Studies* 1, no. 4 (2002): 303–21.
<https://doi.org/10.1163/156921002X00042>.
- Wasserman, H. "Globalized Values and Postcolonial Responses South African Perspectives on Normative Media Ethics." *International Communication Gazette*, 68(1), (2006): 71-91.
- Wasserman, H., Between the local and the global: South African languages and the Internet. In *Media, Identity and the Public Sphere in Post-Apartheid South Africa* 2003. (65-83). Brill.

- Wasserman, H., "Political journalism in South Africa as a developing democracy—understanding media freedom and responsibility." *Communication: South African Journal for Communication Theory and Research*, 36(2), (2010):240-251
- Zarkov, Dubravka. "Exposures and Invisibilities: Media, Masculinities and the Narratives of Wars in an Intersectional Perspective." In *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a Multi-Faceted Concept in Gender Studies*, 105–20. Ashgate, 2011.

ABOUT AUTHOR

Juliet Joseph is a Doctoral candidate and researcher at the Department of Politics and International Relations (Politics and IR), and Sarchi Chair: African Foreign Policy and Diplomacy. A few of her research interests are Feminist and Gender studies, Regionalism, African Politics, International Political Economy, Development Administration, Economic Policy and Social Policy in Developing Countries, Development Theory, as well as the broader debates surrounding International Security Studies and Security Communities.