



Catholic Charismatic Renewal and Pentecostalism

Opoku Onyinah¹

¹ Pentecost University, Ghana.

ABSTRACT

A new set of Pentecostal renewal started in the early twentieth century leading to the proliferation of Pentecostal denominations, and renewal movements within the then existing denominations. The beginning of this Pentecostal renewal has often been linked with the Bethel Bible School, which was started by Charles Fox Parham, and amplified by William Joseph Seymour at Azusa Street, Los Angeles, in the US. This article brings another dimension of the renewal by demonstrating that, for the Catholic Charismatics the outbreak of the Holy Spirit in the early twentieth century was partly an answer to the prayer of Pope Leo XIII. In addition, the Catholic Charismatic advocates consider the Pentecostal experience, dubbed Duquesne Weekend, which led to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal movements as the answer to the prayer of Pope John XXIII at the Second Vatican. The considerations of the Catholic Charismatics are presented apparently as an affirmation of the sovereignty of God over his Church and the world.

Correspondence:
Opoku Onyinah
Email: oonyinah@hotmail.com

Manuscript
Received 14th July 2020,
Accepted 14th August 2020,
Published online 24th August
2020.

Keywords: Catholic, Renewal, Pentecostalism, Baptism

INTRODUCTION

The Pentecostal revival that broke out in the early twentieth century, especially at Azusa Street, in the USA, is penetrating through all of the Christian traditions without excuse.² In the 1950s as the baptism in the Holy Spirit began to gain root in some of the established churches, through the Full Gospel Business Men Fellowship, by members who remained in their denomination, the Charismatic Movement came into existence. What the Pentecostals called the baptism in the Holy Spirit began to take place, in early 1960s, among members of these churches including the Episcopalians, Lutherans, and Presbyterians. It was, therefore, no wonder that in 1967, the renewal broke through the Catholic Church.³

The Pentecostal/Charismatic group boast of an estimated number of over 700 million members globally. Out of this, 160 million are supposed to be Catholics.⁴ That means the Catholic Charismatic Renewal (CCR) is a very important movement in the Catholic Church and in the Pentecostal revival. This article attempts to give a brief background of the movements, their organisation, beliefs (theology) and practices and the link between the early outpouring of the Holy Spirit (Pentecostalism) and the Catholic Church.

Origin and Expansion

Significantly, the Catholic Charismatic Renewal all started among few North American Catholics well-educated classes and spread from the same intelligential to the rest of the world. Professor Ralph Keifer, Patrick Bourgeois and few lay faculty members of the Duquesne University, a Catholic University in Pittsburgh, USA, attended the Congress of the

² This article shares similarity with a shorter paper, entitled, "Charismatic Movement within the Catholic Church," which was presented to Missio: glauben.leben. geben to be published in the Theology of the One World Book project.

³ Patti Gallagher Mansfield, *As by a New Pentecost: The Dramatic Beginning of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal* (Steubenville, OH: Franciscan University of Steubenville, 1992), 4. wordofthespirit.net/history-catholic-charismatic-renewal/beginning-of-the-renewal/. Accessed July 24, 2017.

⁴ Alessandra Nucci, "The Charismatic Renewal and the Catholic Church," *The Catholic World Report*, May 18, 2013, <http://www.catholicworldreport.com/2013/05/18/the-charismatic-renewal-and-the-catholic-church>. Accessed July 5, 2019.

Cursillo movement in August 1966.⁵ They were introduced to two books, which speak about Pentecostal faith and practices. These two books, *The Cross and the Switchblade* written by David Wilkerson and *They Speak in Other Tongues* by John Sherill were not only to change their destiny but to cause a renewal, leading to the establishment of a whole movement within the Catholic Church.⁶ Following their quest to experience the Pentecostal concept of the baptism of the Holy Spirit, they sought and attended a prayer meeting in their area, which was mainly attended by mainline Protestant Charismatics. In their second meeting with this group, they were ‘baptised in the Holy Spirit’ and spoke in tongues. Later on, they shared their experience with two close professor friends at the Duquesne University and prayed for them through the laying on of hands, and they also received the ‘baptism’ in the Spirit.⁷ Then, on February 18-19, 1967, these professors and some students of the Catholic University at Duquesne, thirty in all, gathered for a weekend retreat. Meanwhile, the professors had asked the students to read the two books and also the first chapters of *The Acts of the Apostles*.⁸ At this time, the professors had not shared their experience with the students. Yet, it is said that at the end of the prayer meeting, dubbed, “Duquesne weekend”, each of the students had experienced the Holy Spirit in a new way, at different times and in diverse ways; some spoke in tongues and others could feel the presence of God in a special way. This prayer meeting may be termed as officially the beginning of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal.⁹

While this Catholic experience came as a dramatic occurrence in a Catholic university, it did not come unexpectedly. First, the two professors were desiring for spiritual renewal and thus attended the Congress of the Cursillo movement in August 1966. Following that, they also had to attend the prayer group meeting of the mainline Protestant charismatics meetings expectantly. Again, as they read books by Pentecostals, they were fired to receive the experience. The students also had in a way been well prepared by being asked to read the two books and the first four chapters of *The Acts of the Apostles*. Thus, this confirms what Jesus said in the Gospel of John that the Spirit fills those who are thirsty and desire for him (John 7:37-38). From this perspective, it is implicit that while the Catholic Charismatic experience began as a separate entity through the Duquesne Weekend experience, it has a remote link to the Pentecostal experience that began in the early part of the twentieth century.

Similar to many revival movements, the experience did not end at Duquesne. In March 1967 through some of those who had received the baptism, the experience got to Catholic University in Notre Dame.¹⁰ A network developed among the students and staff of Catholic university campuses. Two former graduates of Notre Dame, who were later to become prominent in the CCR, were introduced into the experience, visited the Duquesne and received the baptism. They began a prayer group at the Michigan State University, later joined the staff of the Catholic campus ministry at the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor. The press took notice of the renewal group when a group of students and staff, about 100, met at the Notre Dame in a prayer meeting to reflect on their experience. Notre Dame soon became a venue for annual conferences for those who had received that experience. The movement spread through social network of families and friends, and by letters, phones calls and personal visits and through the sharing of personal experiences with others. It grew not in the US but also in other countries and continents including Latin America, Europe and Africa.¹¹

Many people participated in the annual gathering in Notre Dame. Attendance grew so rapidly that by 1972 more than 11,000 were said to attend from sixteen countries. In 1976, 30,000 adherence were said to attend the conference, and thereafter the leaders decided to promote regional conferences. Yet, while Notre Dame’s participation was limited, it was reported that in 1977, the regional conference in Atlantic City in the US alone gathered more than 37,000.¹² Thus, the movement had grown. Although, in 1982, it was felt that the revival had peaked in the US and there was the need for redirection, generally there has been growth in movement across the globe.¹³ The Catholic World Report indicates that as of 2013, there were over 160 million members,¹⁴ and existed in 230 nations.¹⁵ There was a golden jubilee celebration of the movement in Rome from May 31-4 June 2017. Estimated total participation on Saturday 3 June was 50,000—a significant number to show that the movement was still vibrant. The movement grew because, just the like the Pentecostals, it offered people special experience with

⁵ Cursillo is an apostolic movement of the Roman Catholic Church. The focus of the movement is on showing Christian lay people how to become effective Christian leaders over the course of a three-day weekend. The programme at the weekend includes fifteen talks, some given by priests and some by lay people. The major emphasis of the weekend is to ask participants to take in what they have learned back into the world, on what is known as the “fourth day.” The method stresses personal spiritual development, as accelerated by weekly group reunion (after the weekend). G. P. Hughes and J. F. Byron. “Cursillo,” *Encyclopedia.com*. <https://www.encyclopedia.com/religion/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/cursillo-movement>. Assessed July 25, 2020.

⁶ T. Paul Thigpen, “Catholic Charismatic Renewal,” in *International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, eds. Stanley Burgess and Eduard M. Van Der Mass, 460-467 (Grand Rapid: Zondervan, 2002), 460.

⁷ *Ibid.*, 461.

⁸ Rene Laurentin, *Catholic Pentecostalism* (New York: Doubleday, 1977), 33.

⁹ Thigpen, “Catholic Charismatic,” 461.

¹⁰ Mansfield, *As by a New Pentecost*, 22.

¹¹ Thigpen, “Catholic Charismatic,” 461.

¹² *Ibid.*, 461.

¹³ *Ibid.*, 462.

¹⁴ Alessandra Nucci, “The Charismatic Renewal.”

¹⁵ “Catholic Charismatic Renewal” <http://www.catholicworldreport.com/2013/05/18/the-charismatic-renewal-and-the-catholic-church>. Accessed July 28, 2017.

the Holy Spirit as on the Day of Pentecost, which would bring about the demonstration of charisms and healing.¹⁶

Organisation

The movement operates in two ways in the churches. The first type is the prayer groups and the second is referred to as “covenant communities”. The prayer groups are narrowly based within the community where a person lives, but often includes a limited number of adherence from some parishes. It often conducts a weekly prayer meeting, but occasionally organised additional meetings, such as retreats, seminars and healing services.¹⁷ The covenant community has a larger size and has members who have to commit themselves to explicit forms of a set of rules, beyond ordinary church membership. Members are placed on a trial period and thereafter commit themselves to a written covenant that binds them together. For Thomas Csordas, a North American anthropologist, this system is “through a greater degree of authoritative, commitment of time and resource, and shared situations as well as worship.”¹⁸ Thus there are fewer covenant communities than the prayer meeting. Csordas records that in 2010 while there were about 1983 prayer meetings, there were 89 covenant communities.¹⁹ It is not difficult to understand this. It is easier forming a simple prayer meeting for people to converse and pray than to make written covenants binding them to live an expected standard of life.

The first and most prominent among the covenant communities is the Sword of the Spirit. Other important ones which Csordas highlights are Emmanuel, People of Praise, Catholic Fraternity and the European Network.²⁰ Each of the networks has branches in various countries, a link with the International Catholic Renewal Centre and the church hierarchy.

The everyday life and running of communities are done at local, national and international levels. The leaders occasionally meet at each level. There is a periodical visit by a team to a community and a report is brought back to the leadership. The main existence of the community is for the members to share a common spiritual life, support one another spiritually and advance a collective mission of evangelism with the view of renewing the church.²¹ There are within the communities some similarities as well as dissimilarities. For example, while some close community members may meet in the home of one of them, for lack of proximity others may meet over the phone or Skype. It is expected that each member will develop a close relationship with the same sex mature member who is considered as a spiritual advisor—a pastoral worker or companion.²²

Beliefs and Practices

What the Catholics Charismatics brings to Pentecostalism is quite important for this discussion. The one experience that the Pentecostal revival, which began in the early part of 20th Century brings out is the baptism in the Holy Spirit. With Classical Pentecostals, the evidence of this baptism is speaking in tongues. There was the common expectation that the Catholics who received the Pentecostal experience would lose their faith in the Catholic tradition, leave the church and convert to Pentecostalism. Generally, this has not been the case; rather most of the Catholic Pentecostals remained and have come out with their version of the Pentecostal experience. There have been three views of the Catholic Charismatic of their experience of the Pentecostal concept of the baptism of the Holy Spirit. The foremost interpretation is that “the baptism in the Spirit is a ‘stirring up’ or ‘release’ or ‘actualization’ of the Spirit given in the sacraments of Christian initiation, primarily of baptism and confirmation.”²³ A significant source which brought this interpretation to the forefront was the Malines Document 1, written by a Catholic theologian Fr. Killian McDonnell, himself not part of the renewal movement, but was urged to write at the request of Cardinal Leon Jose Suenens, who had been mandated by Pope Paul VI to provide pastoral supervision of the movement.²⁴ The interpretation became predominant among the Catholic Charismatic worldwide through the work of Fr. George Montague and McDonnell whose research on Christian initiation during the first eight centuries, propounded a comprehensive argument on it.²⁵ Importantly this viewpoint was also the understanding of some of the participants of Duquesne Weekend²⁶ and the early adherents such as Ralph

¹⁶ Thomas Csordas, “A global geography of the spirit: the case of Catholic Charismatic Communities,” in *The Anthropology of Global Evangelicalism*, eds Simon Coleman and Rosalind I. J. Hackett (New York: New York University Press, 2015), 17.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 176.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*

¹⁹ *Ibid.*

²⁰ Emmanuel Community also lists itself as a member of Catholic Fraternity. Csordas, “A global geography,” 177.

²¹ Csordas, “A global geography,” 178.

²² *Ibid.*, 179.

²³ Ralph Martin, “A New Pentecost? Catholic Theology and Baptism in the Spirit,” *Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought & Culture*, 14:3 (Summer 2011): 21.

²⁴ John Joy, “The Outpouring of the Holy Spirit in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Theological Interpretation of the Experience,” *Antiphon* 9.2 (2005): 143.

²⁵ Killian McDonnell, OSB, and George Montague, S. M. *Christian Initiation and the Baptism in the Holy Spirit: Evidence from the First Centuries*, revised edition (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 1994).

²⁶ Mansfield, *As by a New Pentecost*, 13.

Martin and Stephen Clark.²⁷

The proposition is based on the Scriptures in Acts 4:23-35, where the believers prayed and “they were all filled with the Holy Spirit and spoke the word of God boldly” (Acts 4:31, NIV), and 2 Timothy 1:6, where Paul asked Timothy “to fan into flame the gift of God, which is in [him] through the laying on of [Paul’s] hands” (NIV). In both cases, the believers had received the baptism already, yet the persecuted believers were filled with the Holy Spirit, and also Timothy was asked to stir up the gift in him. It is assumed from these texts that there is the possibility of the gift being received at the Christian initiation and later lay dormant.

Furthermore, this belief holds that “the baptism in the Holy Spirit and the manifestation of charismatic gifts in Catholic theology as experienced in the charismatic renewal are not simply optional, personal experience or something to a particular spirituality or movement but something essential to integral Christianity and normative for the entire church.”²⁸

What comes out of this interpretation is that no single gift comes out as the evidence of the baptism in the Spirit as held by the Classical Pentecostals. The advantage of this is to allow the sovereignty of God to dominate in the baptism of the Spirit so as to allow the Spirit to move in whatever direction he feels. This assumption accommodates the new wine, Pentecostalism, within the old wine, intuitionism, and by that makes it easy for the church hierarchy to accept the move of the Spirit within the church, with less difficulty. However, there is a critique against this stands, which can better be summed up by the words of Dr John Joy, a member of the community of the Sword of the Spirit, “it would be too extreme a reaction against Pentecostalism to hold that all grace is given only in the sacraments.”²⁹ This leads to the next viewpoint.

The second view is that the baptism of the Spirit may possibly be considered as “a new sending of the Spirit, a fresh outpouring of the Spirit” apart from the Christian initiation.³⁰ Fr. Francis Sullivan does not dispute the validity of the sacraments of Christianity but to propose what appears to him as to be the right interpretation of what is experienced as the baptism of the Spirit. For him, it is an additional sending instead of an activation of what laid dormant. Sullivan sees the outpouring at Acts 4:31, as God sending fresh outpourings of the Spirit in a non-sacramental context.³¹ The purpose is to equip the Faithful for a special service or for an important step forward in life with Christ. Sullivan’s prayer is that “all Catholics should always be praying for this, ‘a new sending of the Holy Spirit,’ which would begin a decisively new grace in their life.”³² Commenting on this, Joy exclaims, “This seems to be precisely the insight of the Charismatic renewal.”³³

The difference between this view of “a new sending” and the “Christian initiation” is that while the Christian initiation is suggesting an activation of gifts that have been dormant, this one is suggesting a separately “new sending of the Holy Spirit” besides the Christian initiation for the purpose of Christian service and life.

The third view is that the baptism of the Spirit is an eschatological outpouring for world evangelisation in light of the return of Christ.³⁴ This view necessarily sees the baptism of the Spirit as new Pentecost preparing the saints for the return of Christ. This has not caught much attention. What all of these three views bring out an experience of a new phenomenon, which hitherto had not been experienced before by a person. It can, therefore, be inferred from these discussions that the ‘baptism in Holy Spirit’ may bring about an encounter which brings the presence of God to a person in such a way that he had not experienced before. Fr. Harold Cohen expresses the view clearly:

We can expect an immediate or gradual experience of deeper union with God, our loving Father and with Jesus, our Lord and Friend; a fresh appreciation of Scripture; a greater love for others and a desire for Christian fellowship; the fuller presence in our lives of the fruits of the Spirit...; the reception of one or more of the charismatic gifts of the Spirit such as discernment, service, prophecy, praying in tongues, healing.... This gift of new fullness of the Holy Spirit, I believe, is the grace of our age.³⁵

Thus, experiencing the baptism of the Holy Spirit can lead to speaking in tongues, experiencing deeper union with God, or exercising other spiritual gifts. For most of the Catholics, beginning with those who first had the encounter at Duquesne

²⁷ Stephen Clark, however, ties it to confirmation. Stephen Clark, *Life in the Spirit Seminars Team Manual, Catholic Edition* (Ann Arbor MI: Servant, 1969), 117, also his book, *Confirmation and the Baptism of the Holy Spirit* (Pecos, NM: Dove, 1971). Clarks makes a strong case that speaking in tongues is the most common manifestation, but does not doubt any manifestations too.

²⁸ Martin, “A New Pentecost?” 23.

²⁹ Joy, “The Outpouring,” 149. Dr Joy was commenting on Fr Francis Sullivan, who proposed an option to this belief. Sullivan’s assertion will be picked soon.

³⁰ Francis Sullivan, *Charisms and Charismatic Renewal: A Biblical and Theological Study* (Ann Arbor MI: Servant: 1982), 70.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 62.

³² *Ibid.*, 72.

³³ Joy, *The Outpouring*, 161. Joy affirms that, “the experience of Pentecost is perpetuated to the Christian by the sacrament of confirmation”, not baptism. Therefore he sees the use of the terminology “baptism in the Spirit” with reference to the Pentecostal experience as inappropriate. He provides a nuance of Sullivan’s, “new outpourings or invisible sendings of the Holy Spirit”. Joy, *The Outpouring*, 155, 165.

³⁴ Martin, *A New Pentecost?* 26-27.

³⁵ Quoted at the official site of the Diocese of Lafayette of Louisiana, “History of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal,” <https://diolaf.org/history-of-catholic-charismatic-renewal>. Accessed July 28, 2017.

Weekend, the best way to understand their experience was to turn to the Catholic sacramental theology—Christian initiation. It is this way of understanding the baptism in Holy Spirit—the “stirring up’ or ‘release’ or ‘actualization’ of the Spirit given in the sacraments of Christian initiation, primarily of baptism and confirmation,” which articulates the Catholic Charismatic Renewal contribution to the Pentecostal movement.

Surprised to many Classical Pentecostals is the claim by the Catholics Charismatics that the baptism in the Holy Spirit rather has rather given meaning to and deepened their experiences of the confessional, rosary and devotion to Mary.³⁶ Writing two weeks after the Duquesne Weekend, Petti Mansfield Gallagher narrates the words of one professor:

It is not a revolutionary experience because it reaffirmed all the things which I'd been trying to hold on to for years and to affirm for so many years: my appreciation of Scripture, my appreciation of the Eucharist, my appreciation of praying and working with other people. The difference is that it seems to me that everything is easier and more spontaneous and comes from within. It is not so much that I am trying to work with people or that I am trying to advert to God or to pay attention to Him, to make Him the center of my life. This seems to be now a much more spontaneous welling up of these aspirations and this power from within.³⁷

This shows the extent to which most of the adherents were seeking meanings to their traditions, rituals and religiosity. For them, the baptism in the Spirit is the answer; for it offers freshness to archaic practices. The Catholic Charismatics go to the extent of speaking of experiencing the divine presence in the Eucharist. It is claimed that sometimes during the reception of the Holy Communion, charisms and healings, both physical and emotional are received.³⁸ Another distinct practice of the Catholic Charismatic is that they prefer to have a separate service for the Mass, and rather hold praise and prayer meeting either before or after the Mass. This rational apparently is to maintain the centrality of the Eucharist in the Catholic liturgy.

Another practice which some of the Catholic Charismatic still holds is devotion to Mary, to the surprise of many Pentecostals. According to T. Paul Thigpen (an Evangelical Pastor and theologian, who became a Catholic) ‘sometimes the Virgin Mary, who is expected to be in their meetings, is invoked in hymns and prayers.’³⁹ More surprising is the comment by Thigpen that “Marian movement, having grown accustomed to acting as channels of messages from, may not hesitate to express prophecies they believe to have received from Mary or other saints through dreams, visions, or inner locutions.”⁴⁰

One of the areas, which the Catholic Charismatic Renewal movement has brought to the Catholic Church is in the area of forgiveness. The Catholic Church considers reconciliation as a sacrament and a significant step, which leads to the healing of a person. Nevertheless, it was observed, “due to a variety of reasons, the number of Catholics receiving the sacrament of reconciliation is decreasing.”⁴¹ The Catholic Charismatics organise various activities, such as retreats, seminars and healing services to teach participants by drawing their attention to the importance of recognising one own sins and weaknesses and asking for forgiveness, while at the same time forgiving one another. Through such meetings, Father Reginald Alva, a Catholic priest, notices that “through the initiatives of the Charismatics, many Catholics are rediscovering the importance of the sacrament of reconciliation, the need to forgive others and to seek forgiveness.”⁴²

Still another area, which is prominent in the Catholic Charismatics, which of course is not new to the Pentecostals, is a new appreciation for the Scripture and the desire to read and study the Bible, something which is described as, “the scriptures become alive.”⁴³ In their meetings, the Scripture is read and discussed. Adherents are encouraged to read the Scripture as the word of God in order to encounter and allow the stories read to propel them into the process of transformation, personally, socially, politically, and economically. It is believed that if the Scripture is read as the Word of God, it will force them to look at their inner lives, face their bitterness, their anger, their ultimate selfishness and allow those realities to be transformed.⁴⁴

Relation to the Church's Hierarchy

The Charismatic renewal was acknowledged as an answer to the prayer of Pope John XXIII at the beginning of the Second Vatican Council, in 1961, that the Lord should renew his “wonders in our days as in a new Pentecost.”⁴⁵ Mansfield

³⁶ Vinson Synan, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm B. Eerdmans, 1997), 254

³⁷ Mansfield, *As by a New Pentecost*, 13.

³⁸ Thigpen, “Catholic Charismatic,” 466.

³⁹ T.Paul Thigpen, “His Open Arms Welcomed Me – The Story of a Former Evangelical Pastor,” <http://chnetwork.org/story/dr-paul-thigpen-his-open-arms-welcomed-me/>. Accessed August 1, 2017.

⁴⁰ Thigpen, “Catholic Charismatic,” 466.

⁴¹ Reginald Alva, “The Catholic Charismatic Renewal Movement: Forgiveness and Healing,” *Encounter: Journal for Pentecostal Ministry* 13 (Fall 2016): 1.

⁴² Alva, “The Catholic Charismatics,” 6

⁴³ Martin, “A New Pentecost,” 18.

⁴⁴ Chris Thomas, “Reading the Scripture as the Word of God” *Official Site of Catholic Charismatic Renewal of England*, <http://www.ccr.org.uk/about-ccr/goodnews-articles/reading-the-scriptures-as-the-word-of-god>. Accessed August 1, 2017.

⁴⁵ Mansfield, *As by a New Pentecost*, 1.

has shown that Pope John XXIII's prayer might have been influenced by a woman religiously named St. Elena Guerra, and nicknamed the Apostle of the Holy Spirit, who lived around the turn of the nineteenth century.⁴⁶ Sister Elena is said to have written twelve confidential letters to Pope Leo XIII between 1895 and 1903, calling for preaching on the Holy Spirit. Besides, the Pope responding to her plead, at St Elena's suggestion, Pope Leo XIII invoked the Holy Spirit on January 1, 1901, the first day of the year in the twentieth century, the same day that Agnes Osman of Charles Parham's Bethel Bible School also received the Holy Spirit baptism and spoke in tongues. This woman was the first person Pope John XXIII beatified and religiously named St Elena Guerra.⁴⁷ By referring to this, Mansfield is trying to link the Pentecostal revival that broke out in the early part of the twentieth century as partially the results of the Pope's prayer. Interestingly, according to Mansfield, in Topeka, at 17th and Stone Avenue, where the Pentecostal fire in the twentieth century ignited, is now the site of Most Pure Heart of Mary Catholic Church.⁴⁸ In other words, the former Bethel Bible School has been turned into the Catholic Church.

Following this line of thought, all the popes following him have considered the experience as a renewed outpouring of the Spirit of Pentecost within the Catholic Church.⁴⁹ However, the relation between the renewal movement and the church officials have not been always cordial, for various reasons. The clergy is aware that movements that claim divine relations and sometimes led by lay leaders have the potential to cause confusion in an established church, such as the Catholic. Consequently, Pope Paul VI appointed a cardinal, Bishop Suenens, to take pastoral oversight of the renewal movement. Suenens hosted a conference, which led to the provision of a pastoral guideline for the movement.⁵⁰ While Pope John Paul II strongly endorsed the renewal, he also warned them by asking adherents to preserve "fidelity to the ecclesiastical Magisterium, filial obedience to pastors and the spirit of service with regard to local churches and parishes."⁵¹ Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, who was to become Pope Benedict XVI praised the renewal as "the visible signs of the Holy Spirit" but also expressed some concerns. Among these, he emphasized that for the Charismatic renewal, it was "essential, above all, to maintain a balance, to beware of an exclusive emphasis on the Spirit, who, as Jesus himself reminds us, 'does not speak for himself' but lives and works at the heart of the life of the Trinity."⁵² This is a sound caution, good for people of all times leading various renewals and all who claim to have special revelation by the Lord.

CONCLUSION

Indeed, "The wind blows wherever it pleases. You hear its sound, but you cannot tell where it comes from or where it is going..." (John 3:8, NIV). This paper has shown that the Catholic Charismatics claimed that the outbreak of the Holy Spirit, as experienced by the Pentecostals, in the early twentieth century, was partly an answer to the prayer of Pope Leo XIII. Furthermore, they consider the Pentecostal experience, dubbed Duquesne Weekend, which led to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal movements as the answer to the prayer of Pope John XXIII at the Second Vatican. These can be considered an affirmation of the sovereignty of God over his Church and the world. For that which they experienced might be that 'one same experience' which the Pentecostals call the baptism in the Holy Spirit. Although a number of Catholic theologians have offered different interpretations to explain what this experience is, which the Pentecostals call the baptism in the Holy Spirit, is, it is apparent that often what was lurking in the seekers' psyche was to experience the gift of the 'speaking in tongues.' Apparently, as it has not been possible for all seekers to speak in tongues, there had to be a nuance of accepting "deeper feeling of the presence of God" and manifestations of other gifts as equally the baptism of the Spirit. The giving of specific names, such as baptism in the Holy Spirit or initiation, to explain what has happened deeply within people has mostly been influenced by church traditions. Yet, the one thing all seekers claimed to experience was a deeper union with God whose presence was felt within them from different perspectives. If the Pentecostal experience which broke through the then established mainline churches was that one thing which also attracted the Catholic seekers, which eventually led to the outbreak at the Duquesne Weekend (outcome Catholic Revival Movements), and this is linked with the prayer of Pope Leo XIII, then "The wind blows to wherever it pleases..." (John 3:8, NKJV). All the Christian traditions are taking on their rightful position—that is, Pentecostalism.

⁴⁶ As already mentioned, Petti Gallagher Mansfield was among the participants at Duquesne Weekend.

⁴⁷ Mansfield, *As by a New Pentecost*, 3-4.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, 4.

⁴⁹ Martin, "A New Pentecost?" 19-20.

⁵⁰ Thigpen, "Catholic Charismatic," 465.

⁵¹ Quoted in Thigpen, "Catholic Charismatic," 465.

⁵² Quoted in Klimek, "The Spirituality," 23. Joseph Ratzinger interviewed by Vittorio Messori, *The Ratzinger Report. An Exclusive Interview on the State of the Church* (San Francisco: Ignatius, 1987), 152.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Alva, Reginald. "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal Movement: Forgiveness and Healing," *Encounter: Journal for Pentecostal Ministry* (Fall 2016, Vol. 13): 1-9.
- Clark, Stephen. *Life in the Spirit Seminars Team Manual, Catholic Edition*. Ann Arbor MI: Servant, 1969.
- Clark, Stephen. *Confirmation and the Baptism of the Holy Spirit*. Pecos, NM: Dove, 1971.
- Csordas, Thomas. "A global geography of the spirit: the case of Catholic Charismatic Communities," in *The Anthropology of Global Evangelicalism*, eds Simon Coleman and Rosalind I. J. Hackett. New York: New York University Press, 2015.
- Hughes, G. P. and J. F. Byron. "Cursillo," *Encyclopedia.Com*. <https://www.encyclopedia.com/religion/encyclopedias-almanacs-transcripts-and-maps/cursillo-movement>. Assessed July 25, 2020.
- Joy, John. "The Outpouring of the Holy Spirit in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Theological Interpretation of the Experience," *Antiphon* 9.2 (2005): 141-165.
- Mansfield, Patti Gallagher. *As by a New Pentecost: The Dramatic Beginning of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal*. Steubenville, OH: Franciscan University of Steubenville, 1992. wordofthespirit.net/history-catholic-charismatic-renewal/beginning-of-the-renewal/. Accessed July 24, 2017.
- Martin, Ralph. "A New Pentecost? Catholic Theology and Baptism in the Spirit," *Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought & Culture*, 14:3 (Summer 2011): 17-43
- McDonnell, Killian OSB and Montague, George S. M. *Christian Initiation and the Baptism in the Holy Spirit: Evidence from the First Centuries*, revised edition. Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 1994.
- Messori, Vittorio. "Joseph Ratzinger interviewed by Vittorio Messori," *The Ratzinger Report. An Exclusive Interview on the State of the Church*. San Francisco: Ignatius, 1987.
- Nucci, Alessandra. "The Charismatic Renewal and the Catholic Church," *The Catholic World Report*, May 18, 2013, <http://www.catholicworldreport.com/2013/05/18/the-charismatic-renewal-and-the-catholic-church>. Accessed July 28, 2017.
- Thigpen, T. Paul. "Catholic Charismatic Renewal," *International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, eds. Stanley Burgess and Eduard M. Van Der Mass: 460-467. Grand Rapid: Zondervan, 2002.
- Thigpen, T. Paul. "His Open Arms Welcomed Me – The Story of a Former Evangelical Pastor," <http://chnetwork.org/story/dr-paul-thigpen-his-open-arms-welcomed-me/>. Accessed August 1, 2017.
- Thomas, Chris. "Reading the Scripture as the Word of God", *Official Site of Catholic Charismatic Renewal of England*, <http://www.ccr.org.uk/about-ccr/goodnews-articles/reading-the-scriptures-as-the-word-of-god>.
- Sullivan, Francis. *Charisms and Charismatic Renewal: A Biblical and Theological Study*. Ann Arbor MI: Servant: 1982.
- Synan, Vinson. *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*. Grand Rapids, MI: Wm B. Eerdmans, 1997.

ABOUT AUTHOR

Apostle Professor Opoku Onyinah currently Lectures at the Pentecost University, Ghana. He has research interests in Pentecostal and Charismatic Studies, Pentecostal Theology, African Christian Spirituality, Healing and Exorcism.