The Quest for Recognition and Curricularisation of South African Music Education in Basic Education

Sakhiseni Joseph Yende
1 Department of Performing Arts, Tshwane University of Technology, Pretoria, South Africa.

ABSTRACT
Framed within curriculum inquiry theory, this article argues for the necessity to merge music curricula with music educator curricula in the existing Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) offered by the South African Department of Basic Education (DBE). Currently, being educated in music does not qualify a graduate to be a music educator, as an additional qualification is necessary. Music-trained educators leaving universities are required to undertake a Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE) to be recognised as music teachers in public schools, hence the need for reform. The main purpose of this article is to discuss the quest for Recognition and Curricularisation of South African music education in basic education. The study adopted a qualitative research method to collect data, using previous and recent scholarly writings. The findings of this article were presented in themes developed through the questions presented. The over-arching conclusion is that South African universities’ music qualifications should be recognised as teaching qualifications.

Keywords: Basic Education, Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS), Music Educators, PGCE, Skills

INTRODUCTION
It is essential to foreground this paper by stating that there has been a considerable number of research and journal publications regarding the general challenges faced by music education in developing countries, and South Africa is no exception.¹ This study aims to highlight and present some fundamental challenges that have not been appropriately addressed that affect the career of professional music educators. This article further argues that musicians have found it difficult to find employment in education due to unrecognised degrees.² This difficulty means that complex challenges exist in basic education policy and universities offering music degrees that prepare students with the required skills to teach music education. According to Lemuro, “the implementation of music


2 Yende and Mugovhani, “Employability Challenges Facing Vocal Art Graduates in South Africa: A Case Study of Tshwane University of Technology.”
according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement in the Foundation Phase is inadequate.\(^3\) Reasons for this incorporate inter alia lack of knowledge of Music pedagogy by Foundation Phase educators and lack of resources and poor assistance and monitoring from the Department of Education.\(^4\) Yende agrees and indicates that universities should align their curriculum according to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) requirements for music educators.\(^5\)

There has been a national increase in the number of music educators who enrol for music education degrees at institutions of higher learning in South Africa. However, some of these graduates find themselves battling to find employment as their degrees are not recognised in the CAPS curriculum.\(^6\) Limited attention is paid to addressing the challenges professional music specialists face in South Africa. Many public schools in South Africa only recognise educators with PGCE qualifications to teach the Creative Arts subject. Therefore, there is an urgent need to look holistically at the factors that cause the lack of recognition of music qualifications as a teaching qualification for basic education. In light of these problems, it is necessary to address the challenges that affect the career of professional music educators in South African basic education. Therefore, this article focuses on specific questions from the literature on the issues and challenges that affect professional music educators in South African basic education. It discusses and raises awareness on the quest for recognition and curricularisation of South African music for teaching in basic education. Educators who are employed to teach music (Creative Arts subject) in most public schools in South Africa cannot handle all the components of music with equal success, as they are not specialists in all the components and only know one or two.\(^7\) It is also vital to note that this study was propelled by scholarly perceptions that music education has shown no growth in South African public schools. The study thus seeks answers to the following question:

1. What is the history of music education in South Africa before and after 1994?
2. What are the general challenges experienced by professional music educators in South African basic education?
3. Why is music education essential in South African public schools?
4. What could be done to mitigate the recognition of music qualifications as teaching qualifications for basic education?
5. What is the role of universities that offer music as a teaching qualification in South Africa?

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

In this article, the researcher deployed a curriculum inquiry theory to provide a comprehensive argument about the quest for recognition and curricularisation of South African music education for teaching in basic education.\(^8\) Semali and Stambach define the curriculum inquiry theory as a significant approach for investigating the development and implementation of curriculum policies and

---

3 Lerumo, “Implementing Music According to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of Foundation Phase Educators.”
6 Yende and Mugovhani, “Employability Challenges Facing Vocal Art Graduates in South Africa: A Case Study of Tshwane University of Technology.”
programmes in classroom settings. This investigation looked at the body of knowledge that becomes the source of learning and teaching. Using the curriculum inquiry theory, the researcher found it plausible to discuss key issues in this study. The “curriculum inquiry can assist with the identifying discrepancies between curricular ideals, practices, and the methods which could bring them closer.”

In this article, the researcher questions the intentions of the Creative Arts subject under the CAPS curriculum and CAPS practices. Therefore, this theory is appropriate and critical because it is broadly based on a commitment to social justice to the ideal of justice as fairness and the elimination of inequities and possibilities of marginalisation.

According to Short, curriculum inquiry theory is an educational pathway that describes which goals and objectives should be accomplished, which topics should be covered and which learning, teaching, and assessment techniques should be employed. Short states that “curriculum inquiry is assumed to have some requisite value for curriculum action: it has a practical purpose to inform curriculum action.” Following these claims found in the curriculum inquiry theory, the researcher argues that professional music educators need recognition for the capacity building of learners with a farsighted vision, innovative mind and guiding spirit in the classroom. This nexus conjoins the analysis of this article with the curriculum inquiry theory as a theoretical frame of reference in this paper.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Scholars have pointed out that the apartheid government that came into power in 1948 severely oppressed South Africans in all cultural areas, including traditional music experiences and practices. Separatist cultures marked the oppressive system of government. Instead of promoting a homogenous kind of living, the lives of people were divided along racial and ethnic lines. Apartheid affected all community sectors, including politics, religion, culture and education. When South Africa became a democratic country after apartheid ended in 1994, some important changes were made in revising and restructuring the curriculum to improve the quality of education in South Africa.

Music specialists advocated that South African music education was established using a Western orthodox perspective that did not pay attention to most of the marginalised population's traditional music experiences and practices. The South African Basic Education curriculum has been revised three times in terms of its content. The primary purpose of revising the curriculum was to improve the quality of education in South Africa. Firstly, it was known as the National Curriculum Statement in 1997. Afterward, it was amended as a Revised National Curriculum Statement in 2002. Lastly, it was amended as the Curriculum Assessment Policy Statement in 2011 and formalised in 2012. Each revision was an attempt to make South Africa's education system better. A new area of learning resulted from this. Four different art forms—music, visual arts, dance and theatre—were

---


10 Short, Edmund C., ed. *Forms of curriculum inquiry.*

11 Short, Edmund C., ed. *Forms of curriculum inquiry.*


15 de Villiers, “The Transformation of Music Education: A South African Case Study.”

16 Cloete and Delport, “Music Education in the Grade R Classroom: How Three Teachers Learned in a Participatory Action Inquiry.”
combined into one arts-integrated course known as the Creative Arts subject. The integration of music, visual arts, theatre and dance meant that all art forms were to be taught and learned as one subject. Studies by various scholars recognise that the curriculum changes did not yield any better and successful access to the arts, especially music education as educators were not adequately skilled and the government did not make a concerted effort to ensure that policy was implemented through up-skiilling educators and the provision of resources. The continuing professional development programme, described in this article, has had a very limited impact in transforming practice due to the small number of teachers who attended this programme when one compares these numbers to the many underqualified teachers at schools.

Scholars point to the growing challenges regarding music graduates’ employment as educators as a phenomenon that requires special attention in South African basic education. Yende and Mugovhani observed that the current CAPS does not recognise the educational value of music and qualified music educators, negatively affecting most graduates. South African universities offer music as a profession for graduates. However, the South African Department of Basic Education (DBE) does not recognise these music graduates as practitioners qualified for teaching in public schools.

In their study, Yende and Mugovhani reveal that graduates from various universities in South Africa who hold professional degrees in music are always persuaded to enrol in the bridging PGCE course offered by the University of South Africa and the University of Pretoria, among others. This additional course requires the graduates to complete an extra year. Students also must add Higher Diploma in Education (HDE) courses to graduate with a Bachelor of Music (BMus) in Education when graduating from comprehensive universities such as the University of Cape Town’s College of Music. A BMus alone does not qualify a graduate to be recognised as a qualified teacher or educator in the DBE system. Performing arts graduates face some constraints that add to difficulties regarding their employability. If this is the only avenue for these graduates to attain employment. This has significantly perpetuated the unemployment of music graduates.

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

This article adopted a qualitative research method under a content analysis design as the principal methodology. The justification for using a qualitative approach is that qualitative research is a method that allows the researcher to “de-mystify perceptions by pursuing to understand accurate phenomenon or experience.” In this article, qualitative content analysis was based on analysing the content under the guidance of the research question: Why is it necessary to seek recognition and curricularisation of South African music education for teaching in basic education? The qualitative content analysis engages approaches from wide literature to specific themes. The qualitative content analysis helped the researcher identify themes and patterns and describe situations experienced by music graduates in South Africa. Using the content analysis, the researcher ensured that the data logic ties the argument.

---

19 Lerumo, “Implementing Music According to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of Foundation Phase Educators.”
20 Yende and Mugovhani, “Employability Challenges Facing Vocal Art Graduates in South Africa: A Case Study of Tshwane University of Technology.”
21 Yende and Mugovhani. “Employability Challenges Facing Vocal Art Graduates in South Africa: A Case Study of Tshwane University of Technology.”
23 Mojtaba, Turunen and Bondas. “Content Analysis and Thematic Analysis: Implications for Conducting a Qualitative Descriptive Study.”
making the argument of this article more persuasive.\textsuperscript{24} The qualitative content analysis helped the researcher to find sound content and present it in a clear and effective approach. The qualitative content analysis method was suitable for this article as it permitted the researcher to understand the challenges and factors contributing to the lack of recognition of music education in South Africa for teaching in basic education.

To yield precise findings, this article used a narrative thematic analysis using five steps highlighted by Vaismoradi, Turunen, and Bondas:\textsuperscript{25}

a) Collecting data from existing literature  
b) Attaining an inclusive logic of the data collected  
c) Coding the data  
d) Yielding and presenting data in themes.  
e) Interpreting and describing the data.

In this article, the narrative thematic analysis method was the last important stage as it helped the researcher acquire accurate, pertinent and precise data to interpret and present in this study.

**Data acquired according to the developed aims using existing literature**

The findings of this article revealed common themes that emerged from the four basic research questions developed to guide this study. These questions were extensively answered using existing scholarly literary writings. The findings addressed the research questions according to the literature gathered. The questions were divided into four significant sections namely, (1) the history of music education in South Africa before and after 1994; (2) general challenges experienced by professional music educators; (3) the essentiality of music education in South Africa public schools; (4) mitigating the recognition music qualifications for teaching in basic education; (5) role of universities that offer music education as a qualification in South Africa.

**ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS**

Since this research project was based on qualitative content analysis, it had no adverse ethical implications. In other words, this research did not injure anybody or affect anyone’s credibility badly. The project is based on reviewing, rereading, analysing and interpreting the scholarly writings of other scholars’ literature such as articles, theses, books and any other documented data already in the public domain.

**CONCEPTUALISING SOUTH AFRICAN MUSIC EDUCATION**

**History of music education in South Africa - before and after 1994**

Before the democratic government in 1994, music education in South African schools was established on the Western education system and relied heavily on “drill and practice”. Prior to 1994, there was a dark age for Black South Africans as syllabi were dominated by the politically and economically dominant English and Afrikaans language groups. The syllabi were overly prescriptive, biased towards Western European ideals and content, and racially divisive.\textsuperscript{26} Music education in those days was oppressive and characterised by separatist modes of existence instead of promoting a homogenous

\textsuperscript{24} Denzin and Lincoln. *Introduction: The Discipline and Practice of Qualitative Research.*

\textsuperscript{25} Mojtaba, Turunen and Bondas. “Content Analysis and Thematic Analysis: Implications for Conducting a Qualitative Descriptive Study.”

Hence, “African and Indian music was disregarded and therefore excluded in the school curriculum because it was perceived as indecent and ‘evil.’”

With the fall of apartheid and the formation of the Government of National Unity (GNU) in 1994, there was a pressing need for a paradigm shift in various sectors such as education, and parliament, among others, for a new dispensation to address the imbalances of the past. Education became the priority. de Villiers observes that there were significant changes in the educational policy that was expected to provide access to music education for all:

“Previous education policies resulted in access to arts education and music education being denied to the Black majority. Post-1994, when South Africa became a democracy with a constitution underpinned by human rights, various policy changes occurred. Changes in education policy have led to an expectation that there would be a completely different approach to education that would embrace multicultural content and approaches to teaching and learning in line with democratic practice.”

During this period, the post-apartheid South African government, vigorously revised the curriculum to redress the past imbalances in arts education and provide all learners with an education regardless of race. This revision is also substantiated by Lerumo who observes that the 2012 CAPS papers encouraged educators to teach music more constructively and integrate indigenous music from various South African cultures. According to the CAPS policy, learners should be allowed to engage in group performances to build confidence and strengthen their creative and performing abilities. The curriculum revision was inevitably necessary as the CAPS policy at the time had not provided learners with the chance to engage in group performances.

**General challenges experienced by Professional Music Educators in South Africa**

It is useful to highlight the challenges experienced by music educators by mentioning some of South Africa's higher education institutions that offer music education as a career for students. These universities are the Tshwane University of Technology’s Vocal Arts, the University of Cape Town's South African College of Music, the University of South Africa's Music Examinations Directorate, the University of Pretoria's Musaion, the University of Northwest's Potchefstroom Campus, and the University of KwaZulu-Natal's Department of Music. However, like many other graduates from diverse disciplines, professional music educators face general challenges in South Africa. The general challenges experienced by professional music educators in South Africa include unemployment associated with the present curriculum (CAPS) that does not recognise music qualifications as a professional qualification that produces trained educators for music education in public schools. Since the challenges experienced by professional music educators in South Africa stem from the existing curriculum, there is a necessity for curriculum revision to ensure that CAPS recognise music education degree.

---


29 de Villiers, “The Transformation of Music Education: A South African Case Study.”

30 Lerumo, “Implementing Music According to the Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS): Experiences of Foundation Phase Educators.”

31 Lerumo; Yende and Mugovhani, “Employability Challenges Facing Vocal Art Graduates in South Africa: A Case Study of Tshwane University of Technology.”

32 de Villiers, “The Transformation of Music Education: A South African Case Study.”
Essentiality of Music Education in South African Public Schools

The essentiality of music education in South African public schools cannot be overlooked. The essentiality of music education is that it can aid learners in various ways since linkages may be formed across studies to aid learners in developing improved comprehension of concepts across other fields. Music education, in particular, influences learners’ activities and improves language learning. Music education allows learners and teachers to create a shared language and common understanding. A study by de Villiers reveals that learners showed evidence of applying the music literacy skills they had learned by accessing and reading a wider repertoire of music and transcribing to tonic sol-fa, a skill they had learnt in the course. In all the groups, the students passed the summative exam. Music education is essential as it assists learners in improving their reading, hearing, poetry and literature skills. Music education also enables learners to become informed listeners of music by actively listening to a variety of music ranging from Western, and indigenous music to popular music. Music education is essential as it prepares learners for engagement in community life, the workforce and progression to higher education. The DBE views music education as a means of providing learners with opportunities to improve their learning and appreciate South Africa’s diversity, affirm their national heritage through the performance of indigenous music and make a contribution to the economy by encouraging self-employment.

Mitigating the lack of Recognition of the Music Qualification by Basic Education

Scholars have highlighted the problem as the lack of recognition of a music qualification as a teaching qualification by basic education. A possible solution is for music qualifications to be recognised as authentic teaching qualifications for teaching in basic education by revising the CAPS policy. These ongoing challenges experienced by music educators could be mitigated by the DBE if they stop thinking that music qualifications offered by South African universities are not enough for music educators to qualify to teach in public schools. This initiative would close the gap created by inadequate existing policy in DBE. Evidently, if music qualifications were recognised in basic education, learners would benefit significantly from access to music educators. Another challenge faced by music education schools is the lack of music specialists as several schools, especially rural schools rely exclusively on generalist teachers for music education at the primary and secondary school levels. This tends to affect learners as teachers have little understanding of the depth of music in the classroom. There is a need for DBE education to train generalist teachers to teach music education in the classroom.

Role of Universities that offer Music Education as a Qualification in South Africa

It is essential to discuss the role of universities that offer music education as a qualification for students, ensuring that students are exposed to and well-equipped for teaching music. Practical teaching for

34 de Villiers, “The Transformation of Music Education: A South African Case Study.”
40 de Villiers, “The Transformation of Music Education: A South African Case Study.”
potential music educators is essential in the music education curriculum and it must be offered by Tshwane University of Technology’s Vocal Arts, the University of Cape Town's South African College of Music, the University of South Africa's Music Examinations Directorate, the University of Pretoria’s Musaion, the University of Northwest's Potchefstroom Campus, and the University of KwaZulu-Natal's of Music. This practical aspect should be implemented when music education students have practicals in university to prepare them for their careers.

Despite the universities offering music education in South Africa, there is a request for universities to practically train and expose students to teaching music in the classroom. It is also the role of universities to align their curriculum and equip students with the CAPS policy to ensure that music education students are recognised as professional music educators after attaining their degrees.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION
This study used Short’s, Semali and Stambach curriculum inquiry theory’s fundamental principles as a framework for analysis in the quest for recognition and curricularisation of South African music qualifications for teaching in basic education. This is attributed to the increasing number of South African music practitioners forced to enrol for additional certificates to be recognised as professional music educators. This study scrutinised the potential impact of this lack of recognition of music qualifications for education in public schools in South Africa. In so doing, this article argued that the DBE and universities that offer music qualifications must work together to ensure that the policies are relevant to CAPS. The approach and analysis in this study were informed by curriculum inquiry theory which advocates for the development and implementation of curriculum policies and programmes that prioritises practical classroom skills.

The practitioners have to enrol for PGCE to be recognised as professional educators. This article also recognised that South African music education is imperative for improving learners' learning skills. Hence, music practitioners should inclusively be recognised in the existing CAPS. This article also found that it is important and necessary for South African universities that offer music to expose their students to the practical aspect of music to improve their opportunities for employment in basic education. The finding of this study demonstrated that music graduates are inadequately prepared to teach music in the classroom, resulting in too few educators in schools. Music practitioners have insufficient knowledge, abilities and pedagogical competency to teach music, undermining their confidence. This study's findings show that professional music educators in South Africa are battling to find employment, and this corroborates the results of Yende and Mugovhani who found it common that music graduates are persuaded to enrol for postgraduate studies (PGCE) after their music degrees to become employable as professional educators. This study established that universities that offer music education should strive to create a strong relationship with DBE to enhance employability for professional music practitioners as educators in South African public schools. The results of this study reveal that many factors contribute to the challenges faced by professional music practitioners’ employability in South Africa. Universities and DBE should work together to solve this problem.

This article affirms that South African basic education should recognise graduates’ music qualifications from South African universities as teaching qualifications. In addition, this article asserts that there are benefits for learners in terms of cognitive development, well-being and academic achievements that cannot be overlooked. Music education motivates learners to study, improves their self-esteem, and provides problem-solving skills, decision-making and understanding of South African cultural music diversity, among numerous advantages.

THE WAY FORWARD
The findings of this article point out that there is a quest for curricularisation of South African music qualifications to make graduates suitable for teaching in basic education. The researcher strongly

believes that if the DBE can work with universities in the curricularisation of South African music qualifications to improve the possibility of using the qualification to teach music in basic education, the CAPS and professional music educators in South Africa are also able to do same. There is a widespread shortage of preparing music education graduates for teaching in public schools. This shortage can be attributed to the lack of a relationship between universities and DBE, negatively affecting music educators and learners.

RECOMMENDATIONS
Based on the results and analysis of this article, the following recommendations are made:

a) **South African DBE must recognise music educators:** Graduates should be recognised as well-qualified to teach without any further qualification such as PGCE.
b) **University curricula revision:** Universities must constantly revisit and revise their music curricula to align with existing CAPS policy. The curriculum revision would assist South African universities in producing recognised music educators.
c) **Universities and DBE collaboration:** Universities and DBE must work together to improve music educators’ employability.
d) **Research required:** Further research should be conducted with relevant partners such as curriculum developers, policymakers and other stakeholders at the forefront of curriculum for the success of music education in public schools.
e) **A wider range of methodologies:** Methodologies such as interviews are necessary for a richer understanding of the challenges faced by professional music educators in South Africa.

CONCLUSION
This article has argued for the need to merge music curricula with music educator curricula in the existing South African Curriculum. Using qualitative analysis, it found out that the challenge South African professional music practitioners face is that they are not accommodated in the existing CAPS. The researcher ends this article by emphasising that universities that offer music education must take inventive measures to expose music students to practice teaching as the method of partnering with DBE so that all music education students can be observed and trained in handling a classroom. The experience gained will help them become efficient music educators.

BIBLIOGRAPHY
Ndwamato, George, and Mugovhani. “The Androgynic Pedagogic Approach in the Study and
Teaching of Performing Arts in South Africa,” 2012.

ABOUT AUTHOR
Mr. Sakhiseni J. Yende is presently affiliated with the Tshwane University of Technology as a Part Time Lecturer. He is studying towards his PhD at the University of Cape Town in South Africa. Yende’s research sits at the cutting edge and patient in the field of Performing Arts. Yende has acquired extensive academic research skills, as he has also taught research methods course and has researched and supervised both honours and master’s students in a range of Performing Arts fields such as Dance, Vocal Arts (Opera), and Musical Theatre. His research interests are quite diverse but follow six lines: music education, African music, opera, music in political sciences, and education.