






Examining the Continuous Professional Teacher Development Programme in South Africa: A Case Study of Economics and Management Science Teachers in the Thabo-Mafutsanyane District

Habasisa Vincent Molise¹ , Malose Isaac Kola¹  &
Mohammed Xolile Ntshangase¹ 

¹ School of Education, Department of Education Studies, University of Limpopo, Polokwane, South Africa.

ABSTRACT

This study sought to examine the challenges experienced by Economics and Management Sciences (EMS) teachers during Continuous Professional Teacher Development (CPTD) in the Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District, South Africa. This study adopted a relational leadership theoretical framework, which supports the need for school leadership to prioritize relationships when implementing CPTD. This study used a qualitative research approach, which is more interested in analyzing data with the aim of finding the truth than a statistical narrative. Within this study, a case study methodology involving six participants was selected through purposive sampling and snowballing from one school in the Thabo-Mafutsanyane district. The collected data through semi-structured interviews with those six participants was subjected to thematic analysis. This study is important as it shows that healthy school relations are gravely significant for the success of CPTD and that there is a dire need for subject advisors to harmoniously work together with teachers to ensure CPTD programs are effectively implemented.

Correspondence

Habasisa Vincent Molise
Email:
vincent.molise@ul.ac.za

Publication History

Received 15th August, 2023
Accepted 7th November 2023
Published online:
10th January, 2024

Keywords: *Healthy School Relations, Quality Teaching, Continuing Professional Development, Relational Leadership*

INTRODUCTION

The CPTD program in South Africa is central to ensuring quality teaching and learning in EMS. Restoration of healthy relationships between subject advisors and teachers becomes important for enhancing teacher professional development and addressing the challenges teachers experience in teaching EMS. Most of the teachers do not have a subject major in EMS. EMS comprises the economy, entrepreneurship, and financial literacy. The teachers who do not specialize in accounting find themselves struggling to teach financial literacy, which is the accounting part of EMS. Financial literacy is considered the most difficult topic in EMS, and teachers do not do justice in teaching it. In some schools within Free State Province, teachers would refrain from teaching financial literacy altogether. However, most of the learners lost their passion to learn or take EMS as their subject major because they found it too abstract for them. Similarly, the professional development of teachers does not focus on workshops that are organized to capacitate and address teachers' specific content knowledge challenges. For these workshops to be effective, the teacher's content needs must be taken into account in order to address the inherent content misconceptions. These challenges cause tension between teachers and subject advisors because teachers do not find the workshops beneficial to them, and that further compromises good working relations because they end up embarking on a blaming game.

The continuous professional development of EMS teachers has proven ineffective for several reasons.¹ CPTD commonly takes one day as a workshop, and the views shared at these one-day sessions are only focused on how to do what is wanted without any engagement in challenging the status quo. In other words, in such workshops, no one does anything about challenges with regard to fundamental knowledge and beliefs about teaching and learning. Dube and Jita argue that this form of CPTD is typically generic as it is a "one-size-fits-all" experience rather than being based on the experiential views of teachers, their curriculum, as well as local context.² According to Duncan, et. al, these kinds of CPTD workshops lack the use of teachers' thinking, which should be used as a basis for planning, evaluating, and revising instruction.³ The facilitators and organizers of the Teacher Development Programme (TDP) in the Free State expressed concern that judging from their throughputs, academic performance in EMS remained a huge challenge.⁴ This concern is consistent with some advocacies that the "Integrated Strategic Planning Framework for Teacher Education and Development" (ISPFTED) made, that lack of access to quality CPTD opportunities leads to subject content knowledge disparities that threaten the success of effective and efficient CPTD.⁵

Several studies on the continuous professional development of teachers show that not much has been done to enable effective teaching and learning of EMS in schools.⁶ These studies acknowledged that most teachers attended numerous teacher development programs, which are organized by the Department of Basic Education (DBE) through workshops.⁷ However, these teachers still felt incapacitated about the specific content knowledge required to effectively teach EMS in their classrooms.⁸ This is corroborated by Mokgosi, et. al., who indicate that continuing professional development (CPD) programs that have been implemented to equip teachers with teaching skills and subject content knowledge to improve their practice and subsequently learner performance do not seem to have significantly improved classroom practices and the academic results of numerous schools.⁹ Studies on the professional development of teachers further indicated that teachers encountered content knowledge challenges in their lessons.¹⁰ These challenges included their inability to encourage and inspire learners in inquiry-based learning,¹¹ where learners need to observe, think critically, solve problems, and discuss their findings with their peers to find solutions.¹² The researchers argue that teachers can make a desirable difference if they are offered continuing professional development, which addresses their content knowledge gaps in teaching the EMS content. The research uses qualitative research based on a case study approach to report the collected data on the importance of healthy school relationships during the professional development of EMS teachers. The study poses the following research questions:

- What are the content knowledge needs of teachers for their effective professional development to materialize?

¹ Gomba Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, "Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province," in *Teacher Education in the 21st Century* (IntechOpen, 2019), <https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.84836>.

² Bekithemba Dube and Thuthukile Jita, "Rethinking Healthy School Relations for Curriculum Change in Zimbabwe: A Relational Leadership Approach," *Issues in Educational Research* 28, no. 4 (2018): 901–17.

³ Heather Duncan, Bret Range, and Susan Scherz, "From Professional Preparation to On-the-Job Development: What Do Beginning Principals Need?," *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation* 6, no. 3 (2011): n3.

⁴ Moeketsi Simon Mosia, "Periodisation of Mathematics Teacher Knowledge for Teaching: A Construction of Bricolage," *Southern African Review of Education with Education with Production* 22, no. 1 (2016): 134–51.

⁵ Christian Fischer et al., "Investigating Relationships between School Context, Teacher Professional Development, Teaching Practices, and Student Achievement in Response to a Nationwide Science Reform," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 72(2018):107-21.

⁶ Muhammad Umar Draz and Fayyaz Ahmad, "Continuing Professional Development and Accounting Academics: A Literature Review," *International Journal of Learning and Development* 7, no. 4 (2017): 44–52; Sara Bubb and Peter Earley, "Leading Staff Development for School Improvement," *School Leadership & Management* 29, no. 1 (February 2009): 23–37,

<https://doi.org/10.1080/13632430802646370>; G. M. Steyn, "Educators' Perceptions of Continuing Professional Development for Teachers in South Africa: A Qualitative Study," *Africa Education Review* 7, no. 1 (June 2010): 156–79,

<https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2010.490009>; Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, "Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province."

⁷ F Ravhuhali, A P Kutame, and H N Mutshaeni, "Teachers' Perceptions of the Impact of Continuing Professional Development on Promoting Quality Teaching and Learning," *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 10, no. 1 (2015): 1–7.

⁸ J.P. Fouché, "A Renewed Call for Change in Accounting Education Practices," *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 5, no. 2 (April 25, 2013): 137–50, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09751122.2013.11890071>.

⁹ Patricia Mokgosi, Thelma De Jager, and Toy White, "Lesson Study: Collaborative Enhancement of Economic and Management Sciences (EMS) Teachers' Classroom Practices," *Journal of Educational Studies* 17, no. 1 (2018): 94–114.

¹⁰ Draz and Ahmad, "Continuing Professional Development and Accounting Academics: A Literature Review."

¹¹ Ansie Lessing and Marike De Witt, "The Value of Continuous Professional Development: Teachers' Perceptions," *South African Journal of Education* 27, no. 1 (2007): 53–67.

¹² Fouché, "A Renewed Call for Change in Accounting Education Practices"; Jabulisile C Ngwenya, "Accounting Teachers' Understandings and Practices of Teaching and Assessment in a Context of Curriculum Change," *Alternation* 21, no. 1 (2014): 171–89.

- What opportunities are available for teacher collaboration to enhance professional development?
- What forms of relationships exist between the teachers and subject advisors during the workshops?

The researchers make a call for the incorporation of healthy school relationships when dealing with the professional development of EMS teachers. The paper is organized in the following manner: it looks at the importance and trends in the teaching and learning of EMS. Next, it contextualizes the continuous professional development of EMS teachers through the review of related literature. It then discusses the value of healthy school relationships during the professional development of EMS teachers and presents the findings of the study. The study contributes to the existing body of knowledge using the relational leadership approach to promote healthy relationships during the professional development of EMS teachers. Entrenching healthy school relations enables the subject advisors to establish harmonious working relationships when training or assisting the teachers with the EMS content.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The Importance and Trends in the Teaching and Learning of EMS

According to Ngwenya and Nzuzza, EMS covers valuable skills such as economic, entrepreneurial, financial, and managerial skills that prepare learners for success in different economic and business environments.¹³ Teachers must consider all these skills when planning teaching, learning, and assessment activities.¹⁴ EMS teachers, therefore, are obliged to infuse these skills into the learners. EMS is the foundation of all business, commerce, and management subjects in the Further Education and Training (FET) phase.¹⁵ It is offered in the senior phase from grades 7 to 9 and prepares the learners for business, commerce, and management subjects when they reach the FET phase. This subject is made up of three fundamental components, namely: economy, financial literacy, and entrepreneurship. Accounting is introduced in Financial Literacy, while economics is introduced in Economy. The entrepreneurship component introduces business studies. Teaching EMS in an integrated way thus serves to provide learners with the basic knowledge that would support their choice of subject at the FET level, and it also means that learners who exit the General Education and Training band will have basic knowledge of financial management.¹⁶ Besides, the new curriculum also places an obligation on educators to teach and think about EMS in an integrated way. Consequently, educators teaching EMS must be able to teach at least the basics of economics, accounting, and business studies. Modise indicates that EMS teachers remain challenged to effectively teach financial literacy, which is the accounting part of the EMS.¹⁷ The predicament accrues from the teacher's lack of subject major or minor in accounting for them to effectively teach financial literacy. The view above is supported by Moloi, who asserts that EMS teachers do not receive effective professional development.¹⁸ The workshops that are organized for teachers seem to be irrelevant because they do not focus on improving the content knowledge of the teachers.¹⁹ Teachers are made to teach EMS, though they do not specialize in it, and learners' academic performance in the subject is thus compromised.

Continuous Professional Teacher Development Contextualised

The CPTD of teachers can be conceptualized in many ways, but in the context of this study, CPTD is used to refer to "all-natural learning experiences and those conscious and planned activities aimed to activate directly or indirectly" the content knowledge of Economic and Management Sciences teachers to ensure effective teaching and learning exist during the lessons.²⁰ Ono and Ferreira observed that the training workshop approach

¹³ Jabulisile C. Ngwenya and Siyacela Nzuzza, "Teachers' Views on the Role of Economic and Management Sciences in Preparing Learners for Accounting in the Further Education and Training Phase," *South African Journal of Education* 42, no. 4 (November 30, 2022): 1–8, <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v42n4a2131>.

¹⁴ Alfred Motalenyane Modise, "Pedagogical Content Knowledge Challenges of Accounting Teachers," *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 13, no. 3 (2016): 291–97.

¹⁵ Ngwenya and Nzuzza, "Teachers' Views on the Role of Economic and Management Sciences in Preparing Learners for Accounting in the Further Education and Training Phase."

¹⁶ Habasisa Molise and Bekithemba Dube, "Emergency Online Teaching in Economic and Management Sciences Necessitated by the COVID-19 Pandemic: The Need for Healthy Relations in a Rural Schooling Context," *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 19, no. 6 (2020): 387–400.

¹⁷ Modise, "Pedagogical Content Knowledge Challenges of Accounting Teachers."

¹⁸ Tankiso Moloi, "Analysing the Human Capital Capabilities in the Enterprise Risk Management Function of South Africa's Public Institutions," *Business and Economic Horizons* 14, no. 2 (2018): 375–88, <https://doi.org/10.15208/beh.2018.27>.

¹⁹ Molise and Dube, "Emergency Online Teaching in Economic and Management Sciences Necessitated by the COVID-19 Pandemic: The Need for Healthy Relations in a Rural Schooling Context."

²⁰ Masood Badri et al., "Perception of Teachers' Professional Development Needs, Impacts, and Barriers," *SAGE Open* 6, no. 3 (July 8, 2016): 215824401666290, <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244016662901>; Marcel Van der Klink et al., "Professional Development of

is widely used in the majority of development programs.²¹ They further observed that this approach is used as the sacrosanct model of teachers' CPTD for curriculum implementation in the absence of a provincial education department in the Republic of South Africa. Despite its increase in popularity, the CPTD model of workshops has attracted numerous criticisms as an epitome of ineffective exercise from scholars like Mosia, Barnawi, and Adeleye.²² In leveling CPTD criticisms, scholars like Fouché start from the major fact that CPTD is offered in a 'one-shot' format that is often brief, devoid of relation to teachers' needs, and devoid of any form of follow-up system.²³ Tshelane and Mahlomaholo add by revealing the information that most teacher development workshops for curriculum change implementation have often been conducted by incompetent district trainers who cannot wait to finish that 3- to 5-day period and go home.²⁴

Several scholars, like Lessing and de Witt, Bubb and Earley, Steyn, and others, contend that CPTD should indeed be continuous rather than a once-off event that lacks awareness and fails to address the specific needs of teachers.²⁵ Thus far, Modise and Gomba argue that an ideal CPTD for curriculum change and implementation should be comprised of contextualized content delivery in accordance with the teachers' needs and classroom realities.²⁶ This point is further argued by scholars like Bubb and Earley, Ravhuhali et al, and Gomba as they advance the discussion that the current CPTD activities in South Africa and elsewhere in some nations where they experience curriculum reform are loosely matched to the wide range of professional needs that have nothing to do with the immediate audience.²⁷ At this point, it gets clearer when scholars like Sakketa argue that the inherent nature of these decontextualized CPTD programs suggests their irrelevance and lack of depth in their content to address what the majority of teachers need to be effectively empowered.²⁸ It is appalling that in 2023 scholars are still debating the issue that Adu et al. and Badri et al. discussed to the extent of even putting forth suggestions.²⁹ These scholars suggested back then that since teachers' development needs differ according to context and classroom realities, CPTD content must vary from one educational system to another, as that would open space to accommodate different realities as per the context. However, there seems to be an advanced level of unwillingness to change, even though change seems to be more necessary.

The Value of Healthy School Relations during the CPTD of the EMS teachers

A study by Gomba on professional networks, or learning in clusters, revealed that teachers work in isolation.³⁰ If teachers work together in a cluster, possibilities exist for dealing with content knowledge gaps. Scholars like Van der Klink, et. al., have added the suggestion that schools should use the most experienced teachers to mentor

Teacher Educators: What Do They Do? Findings from an Explorative International Study," *Professional Development in Education* 43, no. 2 (March 15, 2017): 163–78, <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2015.1114506>; Murat Hismanoglu and Sibel Hismanoglu, "English Language Teachers' Perceptions of Educational Supervision in Relation to Their Professional Environment: A Case Study of Northern Cyprus," *Novitas-ROYAL (Research on Youth and Language)* 4, no. 1 (2010).

²¹ Yumiko Ono and Johanna Ferreira, "A Case Study of Continuing Teacher Professional Development through Lesson Study in South Africa," *South African Journal of Education* 30, no. 1 (March 4, 2010): 59–74, <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v30n1a320>.

²² Mosia, "Periodisation of Mathematics Teacher Knowledge for Teaching: A Construction of Bricolage"; Osman Z. Barnawi, "Dialogic Investigations of Teacher–Supervisor Relations in the TESOL Landscape," *Cogent Education* 3, no. 1 (December 31, 2016): 1217818, <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2016.1217818>; OLATUNJI JOHN Adeleye, "Pedagogical Challenges on the Effectiveness of Business Studies Teachers in Junior Secondary Schools, Oyo State," *International Journal of Advanced Academic Research* 3, no. 3 (2017): 32–46.

²³ Fouché, "A Renewed Call for Change in Accounting Education Practices."

²⁴ Molaodi Tshelane and Sechaba Mahlomaholo, "Creating Sustainable Learning Environments for Professional Curriculum Leadership through Information and Communication Technologies," *Journal of Higher Education in Africa/Revue de l'enseignement Supérieur En Afrique* 13, no. 1–2 (2015): 193–212.

²⁵ Lessing and De Witt, "The Value of Continuous Professional Development: Teachers' Perceptions"; Bubb and Earley, "Leading Staff Development for School Improvement"; Steyn, "Educators' Perceptions of Continuing Professional Development for Teachers in South Africa: A Qualitative Study."

²⁶ Modise, "Pedagogical Content Knowledge Challenges of Accounting Teachers"; Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, "Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province."

²⁷ Bubb and Earley, "Leading Staff Development for School Improvement"; Ravhuhali, Kutame, and Mutshaeni, "Teachers' Perceptions of the Impact of Continuing Professional Development on Promoting Quality Teaching and Learning"; Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, "Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province."

²⁸ Tekalign Gutu Sakketa, "Institutional Bricolage as a New Perspective to Analyse Institutions of Communal Irrigation: Implications towards Meeting the Water Needs of the Poor Communities," *World Development Perspectives* 9 (2018): 1–11.

²⁹ Kemi O Adu, N Duku, and Emmanuel Olusola Adu, "Role of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD) on Teachers' and Learners' Achievement in South Africa: A Literature Review," *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science (2147- 4478)* 12, no. 7 (October 28, 2023): 542–48, <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v12i7.2799>; Badri et al., "Perception of Teachers' Professional Development Needs, Impacts, and Barriers."

³⁰ Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, "Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province."

the newly qualified ones.³¹ They argue that a teacher who has been in the EMS field longer can provide useful insights, help, and support as needed. In actuality, these scholars have noticed that newly qualified teachers need the mentorship of people who have been in the educational environment long enough to know the best teaching practices, as those may give guidance. Teachers' clusters and networks "are structured to promote collaboration and mutual support for CPTD with teachers within the same schools and other schools."³² Therefore, teachers work collaboratively to assist each other by "creating networks of learning between schools to share best practices in teaching EMS, including unpacking the content knowledge misconceptions, choice of good textbooks, and activities for learning."³³

Over time, Wessels and Woods observed that subject advisers get criticized for their virtual lack of ongoing support and development opportunities when teachers have come back from those developmental workshops.³⁴ These scholars, like Ravhuhali et al., vividly argue that large-scale workshops commonly fail to make a noticeable impact on the betterment or renewal of teachers' good practices because there is no follow-up in schools.³⁵ Considering the above viewpoints, Dasoo emphatically argues that the content of CPTD workshops for the current teachers should focus on deepening subject knowledge as well as teaching and assessment methods that bear success in a learner-centered manner.³⁶ In addition, Derakhshan et al. further argue that some newly qualified teachers need guidance in evaluating and selecting good textbooks with enough activities from which learners can greatly benefit.³⁷ However, Adu et al. argue that for a successful and effective CPTD, there is a factor of time that is commonly unavailable, and if that can be circumvented during preparation and continuous mentoring, things can go well.³⁸ In the hope that the CPTD workshops can be improved, Njenga stresses that CPTD is a process through which content knowledge and understanding, skills, and abilities may be passed on to less experienced teachers.³⁹

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The researcher used relational leadership (RL) as a lens through which the CPTD of teachers could be implemented effectively.⁴⁰ RL acknowledges the impact of individual teachers working together with their subject advisor.⁴¹ According to Campbell, this collaboration between teachers and their subject advisors draws attention to the importance of healthy relationships among new teachers and their supervisors.⁴² Many scholars, like García-Moya et al., have argued that RL offers an overarching social influence process through which emergent coordination and change of values, attitudes, behaviors, and ideologies construct a conducive milieu

³¹ Van der Klink et al., "Professional Development of Teacher Educators: What Do They Do? Findings from an Explorative International Study."

³² Mokgosi, De Jager, and White, "Lesson Study: Collaborative Enhancement of Economic and Management Sciences (EMS) Teachers' Classroom Practices."

³³ Tabitha Grace Mukeredzi, "Professional Development through Teacher Roles: Conceptions of Professionally Unqualified Teachers in Rural South Africa and Zimbabwe," *Journal of Research in Rural Education* 28, no. 11 (2013): 1–16; Van der Klink et al., "Professional Development of Teacher Educators: What Do They Do? Findings from an Explorative International Study."

³⁴ Elsabé Wessels and Lesley Wood, "Fostering Teachers' Experiences of Well-Being: A Participatory Action Learning and Action Research Approach," *South African Journal of Education* 39, no. 1 (2019).

³⁵ Ravhuhali, Kutame, and Mutshaeni, "Teachers' Perceptions of the Impact of Continuing Professional Development on Promoting Quality Teaching and Learning."

³⁶ N. Dasoo, "Teacher Advocacy for the Enhancement of Professional Learning and Development in Continuous Professional Teacher Development Programmes," *South African Journal of Higher Education* 34, no. 4 (September 2020), <https://doi.org/10.20853/34-4-3485>.

³⁷ Ali Derakhshan et al., "Examining the Roles of Continuing Professional Development Needs and Views of Research in English Language Teachers' Success.," *Tesl-Ej* 24, no. 3 (2020): n3.

³⁸ Adu, Duku, and Adu, "Role of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD) on Teachers' and Learners' Achievement in South Africa: A Literature Review."

³⁹ Moses Njenga, "Teacher Participation in Continuing Professional Development: A Theoretical Framework," *Journal of Adult and Continuing Education* 29, no. 1 (May 1, 2023): 69–85, <https://doi.org/10.1177/14779714221123603>.

⁴⁰ Brigitte Smit, "Expanding Educational Leadership Theories through Qualitative Relational Methodologies," *Magis, Revista Internacional de Investigación En Educación* 11, no. 22 (October 16, 2018): 75–86, <https://doi.org/10.11144/Javeriana.m11-22.eelt>; Tayyaba Akram, Shen Lei, and Muhammad Jamal Haider, "The Impact of Relational Leadership on Employee Innovative Work Behavior in IT Industry of China," *Arab Economic and Business Journal* 11, no. 2 (December 2016): 153–61, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aebj.2016.06.001>; Apollonia A Hangeior, Iorbee Fidelis Ihagh, and Umogbai Monica Esiebugie, "Effect of Relational Leadership on Organizational Effectiveness in the Nigerian Public Sector: A Study of Power Holding Company of Nigeria," *Imperial Journal of Interdisciplinary Research* 2, no. 8 (2016): 1326–32.

⁴¹ Smit, "Expanding Educational Leadership Theories through Qualitative Relational Methodologies."

⁴² Louise Campbell, "Pedagogical Bricolage and Teacher Agency: Towards a Culture of Creative Professionalism," *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 51, no. 1 (January 2, 2019): 31–40, <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2018.1425992>.

for CPTD.⁴³ This reverberates the arguments by Green and Kearney and Barnawi, who jointly hold that RL creates the concept of reciprocal control, which is not a coercive form of control but rather a befitting attempt to collectively coordinate all functions.⁴⁴ Therefore, it seems most correct to argue that RL is ideal for this study in the sense that it is purposeful in building commitment towards positive change, which is inclusive of people with diverse points of view, as Zhang and Yao argue.⁴⁵ Zhang and Yao seem to corroborate the views held by Apollonia, et. al., who argued that RL guarantees effectiveness in empowering and developing those who get involved and participate in the professional development process.⁴⁶ RL, in the context of continuous professional development, facilitates the permeation and internalization of expertise among educators.⁴⁷ Raynor's idea and argument build on the views of Sakketa, and Gray and Downey, wherein scholars hold that RL builds relationships and creates a safe space that translates into networking and healthy, friendly practices that breed success.⁴⁸ According to scholars like Wong, et. al., as well as Gowing, RL can be described as the framework that strongly encourages collective participation in creating a sense of mentorship and direction for the results that everyone will feel entitled to as a collective achievement.⁴⁹ This study adopts RL as the only theoretical framework that shifts attention from continuous professional development being orchestrated only by subject advisors because of their condescending authority over EMS teachers.⁵⁰

METHODOLOGY

This study is located within the Transformative Paradigm (TP). TP is the most relevant paradigm in this study because of its quest to understand social concerns among people and their confinements. According to Wessel and Wood, the ontology of TP evolves around the understanding that socio-political values construct the very reality that people cannot possibly evade.⁵¹ Since this study has an interest in dealing with real conditions and concerns that affect real people, there needed to be real participants who voiced their views about CPTD programs and their professional developmental effectiveness.⁵² It is against that backdrop that TP has to be married to Participatory Action Research (PAR) for this study to happen fairly.⁵³ Since ages ago, PAR has been known as the research methodology that allows and motivates people who have been victims of a problematic situation to participate in devising a solution to the problem.⁵⁴ According to Green and Kearney, PAR is a design that equips the researcher to plan together with the participants in the study.⁵⁵ Actually, this design works very

⁴³ Irene García-Moya, Carmen Moreno, and Fiona M. Brooks, "The 'Balancing Acts' of Building Positive Relationships with Students: Secondary School Teachers' Perspectives in England and Spain," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 86 (November 2019): 102883, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.102883>.

⁴⁴ Alison Green and Judith Kearney, "Participatory Action Learning and Action Research for Self-Sustaining Community Development: Engaging Pacific Islanders in Southeast Queensland," *The Australasian Journal of University-Community Engagement* 6, no. 1 (2011): 46-68; Barnawi, "Dialogic Investigations of Teacher-Supervisor Relations in the TESOL Landscape."

⁴⁵ Xianchun Zhang and Zhu Yao, "Impact of Relational Leadership on Employees' Unethical pro-Organizational Behavior: A Survey Based on Tourism Companies in Four Countries," *PLOS ONE* 14, no. 12 (December 9, 2019): e0225706, <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0225706>.

⁴⁶ Zhang and Yao, "Impact of Relational Leadership on Employees' Unethical pro-Organizational Behavior: A Survey Based on Tourism Companies in Four Countries"; Hangeior, Ighag, and Esiebugie, "Effect of Relational Leadership on Organizational Effectiveness in the Nigerian Public Sector: A Study of Power Holding Company of Nigeria."

⁴⁷ Katrina Raynor, "Participatory Action Research and Early Career Researchers: The Structural Barriers to Engagement and Why We Should Do It Anyway," *Planning Theory & Practice* 20, no. 1 (January 11, 2019): 130-36, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14649357.2018.1556501>.

⁴⁸ Sakketa, "Institutional Bricolage as a New Perspective to Analyse Institutions of Communal Irrigation: Implications towards Meeting the Water Needs of the Poor Communities"; Tonia Gray and Greg Downey, "Incorporating Participatory Action Research and Social Media as a Research Tool Whilst Gen-Y Studies Abroad," in *The Globalisation of Higher Education* (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018), 197-216, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-74579-4_12.

⁴⁹ Hin Chow Wong, Subramaniam Sri Ramalu, and Francis Chuah, "An Overview of Leadership and the Emerging of Relational Leadership," *Journal of Human Resource and Leadership* 4, no. 1 (2019): 32-43; Annie Gowing, "Peer-Peer Relationships: A Key Factor in Enhancing School Connectedness and Belonging," *Educational and Child Psychology* 36, no. 2 (2019): 64-77.

⁵⁰ Molise and Dube, "Emergency Online Teaching in Economic and Management Sciences Necessitated by the COVID-19 Pandemic: The Need for Healthy Relations in a Rural Schooling Context."

⁵¹ Wessels and Wood, "Fostering Teachers' Experiences of Well-Being: A Participatory Action Learning and Action Research Approach"; Raynor, "Participatory Action Research and Early Career Researchers: The Structural Barriers to Engagement and Why We Should Do It Anyway."

⁵² Bunmi Omodan, "Democratic Pedagogy in South Africa: A Rethinking Viewpoint for Knowledge Construction.," *Journal of Social Studies Education Research* 10, no. 2 (2019): 188-203.

⁵³ Tshelane and Mahlomaholo, "Creating Sustainable Learning Environments for Professional Curriculum Leadership through Information and Communication Technologies."

⁵⁴ Joe L Kincheloe, "Critical Complexity and Participatory Action Research: Decolonizing 'Democratic' Knowledge Production," in *Education, Participatory Action Research, and Social Change: International Perspectives* (Springer, 2009), 107-21.

⁵⁵ Green and Kearney, "Participatory Action Learning and Action Research for Self-Sustaining Community Development: Engaging Pacific Islanders in Southeast Queensland."

well with the RL theoretical framework because they both talk about the involvement of all people for the same purpose, which includes changing the discomfoting status quo.⁵⁶ This is supported by Raynor, who argues that PAR values local knowledge, which means this method values the experience of real people facing challenges in this world rather than creating some superficial problems.⁵⁷

Participants selection

The study participants consisted of six EMS teachers, and they are profiled in Table 1 below as follows:

Table 1: Profile of the participants

Pseudonym	Affiliation	Gender	Age	Grade/Subject
Pule (Teacher)	Deputy Principal	Male	45-50	Physical Science
Lemza (Teacher)	HoD-Commercial subjects	Male	40-45	Economics
Gloria (Teacher)	Senior teacher-Economics	Female	55-60	Economics
Alice (Teacher)	PL1-Economics	Female	40-45	Economics
Tshepo (Lecturer)	Economics Education	Male	40-45	Economics
Mdu (LF)	Subject advisor-Economics	Male	55-60	Economics

The teachers were selected because they were the recipients of the professional development workshops organized by the subject advisor. The subject advisor is responsible for supporting the teachers to implement the curriculum as planned through workshops regarding the EMS content. The subject advisor is also the subject specialist, who is trained to monitor and evaluate the teachers' work as they present their lessons. The teachers were also very important in the study because they are the ones who receive the workshops that aim to enhance their own professional development. Purposive sampling was used to select six participants in one school within the Thabo-Mofutsanyane Education District. The use of purposive sampling was found relevant because the targeted sample, teachers, and subject advisor possessed the desired knowledge regarding the phenomenon under study.⁵⁸

Data Collection

Semi-structured interviews were adopted in order to solicit the sharing of information between the researchers and the participants.⁵⁹ Semi-structured interviews enabled the researchers to inquire from their participants in an open-minded way that allowed the participants to vent out their feelings, emotions, and experiences regarding the issue being studied.⁶⁰ According to Ruslin et al., semi-structured interviews are a good tool that makes participants feel at ease giving as much information as they want.⁶¹ The interview guide indicating the study's research questions was drafted and given to the participants at a reasonable time for them to think about and remember all that can help in their discursive contribution.⁶² Due to the confidentiality clause in the ethical clearance terms and conditions, all participants had the liberty to express their views clearly and without any fear.

Data Analysis

This study adopted Thematic Analysis (TA) as the method to process the collected data. According to Omodan, TA can be used as a conceptualized way to categorize qualitative data into themes.⁶³ The researchers in this study used TA as a way of selecting the most relevant data from the less relevant and cutting down the excessive information into understandable pieces that can be processed to the advantage of this particular study. Gowing argues that TA can be used to present data in themes about the focus of the study with an illustration of diverse interpretations and meanings.⁶⁴ TA seemed most relevant in this study because it enabled the researchers to

⁵⁶ Tshelane and Mahlomaholo, "Creating Sustainable Learning Environments for Professional Curriculum Leadership through Information and Communication Technologies."

⁵⁷ Raynor, "Participatory Action Research and Early Career Researchers: The Structural Barriers to Engagement and Why We Should Do It Anyway."

⁵⁸ Ngwenya, "Accounting Teachers' Understandings and Practices of Teaching and Assessment in a Context of Curriculum Change."

⁵⁹ Omodan, "Democratic Pedagogy in South Africa: A Rethinking Viewpoint for Knowledge Construction."

⁶⁰ Ngwenya, "Accounting Teachers' Understandings and Practices of Teaching and Assessment in a Context of Curriculum Change."

⁶¹ Ruslin Ruslin et al., "Semi-Structured Interview: A Methodological Reflection on the Development of a Qualitative Research Instrument in Educational Studies," *IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME)* 12, no. 1 (2022): 22–29.

⁶² Ngwenya and Nzuzza, "Teachers' Views on the Role of Economic and Management Sciences in Preparing Learners for Accounting in the Further Education and Training Phase."

⁶³ Omodan, "Democratic Pedagogy in South Africa: A Rethinking Viewpoint for Knowledge Construction."

⁶⁴ Gowing, "Peer-Peer Relationships: A Key Factor in Enhancing School Connectedness and Belonging."

thematically analyze the data in a way that simplified it and remained only with what was relevant to this study rather than having a load of data that might not be relevant for this study. Once the data is thematically set, it all falls into themes that were coded and categorized into different key-related codes. During the research process, ethical issues were closely observed to ensure the protection of all participants' rights. Dube and Jita argue that participants' safety must be observed at all times rather than prioritizing research over humans.⁶⁵ Based on the protection clause, this study adopted the use of pseudonyms to conceal the identity of the participant while their views or experiences are used in this study.⁶⁶ Therefore, in this study, the participants' identities were not revealed, but the ideas, views, and experiences discussed are from real people who faced the true realities as discussed in this study.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This section presents and discusses the challenges experienced by EMS teachers during their CPTD program.

Table 1: Themes and Related Key Codes	
Themes	Key-Related Codes
Theme 1: Content knowledge needs	Workshops which are organized
	Topics that are challenging
	Necessary expertise
	Individual teachers need
	Challenging topics for teachers
Theme 2: Strengthening collaboration	Work with teachers from other schools
	Host subject meetings to share best practices
	Cooperate with other teachers
	Complain about time
	Transportation costs for teachers
Theme 3: Healthy relationships	Content mistakes during workshops
	The need to support teachers
	Fault finding mission
	Labeled as ineffective teachers
	Prioritize professional development
	Doing justice in prioritizing certain topics

Understanding Content Knowledge needs for Teachers to provide Relevant Support

The literature revealed that the inherent decontextualized nature of the CPTD program offered to the teachers is irrelevant and lacks depth in its content to address what the majority of teachers need to be able to improve their practice effectively.⁶⁷ During the semi-structured interviews, Alice noted that:

The quarterly workshops organized for teachers are not beneficial at all. The subject advisors opt to train teachers on the accounting content they understand; they are also not equipped with the content knowledge because certain topics, like accounting equations, end up being presented by colleagues from different schools. We are not even asked to explain the topics that seem challenging to us so that we can be assisted.

Also, Gloria indicated that:

In my entire career of teaching EMS, I often find myself struggling to teach it, especially the financial literacy part since I did not do accounting at the university. So I do not think I am doing justice when I teach because accounting requires somebody with the necessary expertise.

⁶⁵ Dube and Jita, "Rethinking Healthy School Relations for Curriculum Change in Zimbabwe: A Relational Leadership Approach."

⁶⁶ Ngwenya and Nzuzwa, "Teachers' Views on the Role of Economic and Management Sciences in Preparing Learners for Accounting in the Further Education and Training Phase."

⁶⁷ Sakketa, "Institutional Bricolage as a New Perspective to Analyse Institutions of Communal Irrigation: Implications towards Meeting the Water Needs of the Poor Communities."

Asked how this could be mitigated, Mdu said:

I fully understand the importance of meeting individual teachers' needs in terms of topics that appear to be challenging to them, but sometimes, as subject advisors, we have only three hours a day to conduct the workshop, and we do not have time for that. Sometimes teachers do not want to come open and share their accounting content challenges, even if you see that the person is struggling, but they do not bother. They simply do not want to appear stupid before their peers.

Lemza added that:

The time for workshops is limited; it would be much better if the subject advisors asked us to write the specific accounting content challenges before the workshops so that extensive preparation is done. This will help in consolidating the most challenging topics for teachers instead of asking them to share their challenges during the workshop. This can be so intimidating.

The utterances from the four participants above emphasize the importance of conducting a needs assessment to understand specific content knowledge gaps that the teachers may have. This will ensure effective planning of workshops that are meant for teachers. Therefore, a one-size-fits-all approach should be discouraged when professional development workshops are implemented to address the content knowledge gaps of EMS teachers.

Strengthening collaboration through team teaching and hosting frequent cluster meetings

The literature revealed that teachers do not work collaboratively when planning their lessons. There is no frequent cluster meeting that is hosted to assist the teachers with the content knowledge challenges they experience during their lessons.⁶⁸ For effective CPTD to exist, teachers are supposed to establish teaching networks with their counterparts from other schools and share best practices on how to approach certain topics.⁶⁹ In the semi-structured interviews, Lemza indicated that:

The heavy demands on the completion of the syllabus make it difficult for me to work with the teachers from the other schools. To avoid being called to account, I just rush through the content so that there is evidence that I have completed the required assessment tasks by subject advisors.

Gloria added that:

We hardly host subject meetings to share the best practices on how to approach certain topics in EMS, except when we are supposed to evaluate one another for the sake of IQMS.

When asked about the reason for this, Tshepo said:

Some schools do not want to cooperate with others; they do not want to release their teachers to go and assist in other schools. Some of the teachers I sometimes make arrangements with to come to my school complain about the time since they have to come either after school or during weekends. This becomes a burden for me because I have to take care of their transportation costs, and the school is not always prepared to help.

The utterances by the three participants show that teachers are not hosting continuous meetings and are not prepared to collaborate with other teachers from their school and outside to share their best experiences on how to teach EMS. Teachers should work together and help one another to address the content misconceptions they might have in the teaching of EMS instead of relying on professional development workshops that are organized by the subject advisors.

Defusing Power Struggles to Ensure Healthy Relationships during Professional Development

The literature revealed that subject advisors are criticized for their virtual lack of ongoing support and development opportunities, especially when teachers return to schools after receiving development workshops.⁷⁰

⁶⁸ Katrien Vangrieken et al., "Teacher Communities as a Context for Professional Development: A Systematic Review," *Teaching and Teacher Education* 61 (January 2017): 47–59, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.10.001>.

⁶⁹ Selcuk Dogan, Rose Pringle, and Jennifer Mesa, "The Impacts of Professional Learning Communities on Science Teachers' Knowledge, Practice and Student Learning: A Review," *Professional Development in Education* 42, no. 4 (August 7, 2016): 569–88, <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2015.1065899>.

⁷⁰ Wessels and Wood, "Fostering Teachers' Experiences of Well-Being: A Participatory Action Learning and Action Research Approach."

As a result, the large-scale workshops often failed to make a noticeable impact on the betterment or ‘renewal’ of teachers’ practice.⁷¹ During the semi-structured interviews, Alice indicated that:

The problem is that our subject advisor is not approachable; he is full of himself; he believes he knows more than us; and there is nothing he can learn from us. Sometimes he makes a lot of mistakes when teaching us about the content. A teacher from (name of school hidden) school is very good at accounting; her learners are doing perfectly well, and I like the way she presents, which is simple and straightforward, and I feel I understand the content easily.

When asked how this can be mitigated, Lemza indicated that:

I think if our subject advisor could work together with us and see the need to support us, we could be better teachers instead of him always embarking on a fault-finding mission to bring our challenges into the spotlight without the necessary support. I sometimes feel left alone, wondering if I am doing the right thing because I am not assisted in dealing with the content misconceptions I have.

Gloria added:

This is beyond our control; we are already in the system, and being blamed for being ineffective teachers won’t help. I think the department should prioritize the professional development of EMS teachers. Otherwise, we all end up in a blame game. As my HOD always does, I don’t do justice to teaching certain topics, yet I indicated that I do not have any major in accounting.

The utterances from the three participants above show that the subject advisors who have bestowed the responsibility to professionally develop the EMS teachers are battling to instill a relationship of trust between them and the teachers. The positive attitude of the subject advisors and how they conduct themselves during the workshops determines the level of participation by the teachers and their eagerness to ask questions when they do not understand some of the content in EMS.

DISCUSSION OF FINDINGS

The success of any teacher's professional development depends on the type of university training that teachers receive. Adequate subject content knowledge is a prerequisite for EMS teaching practice.⁷² Teaching and learning across all subjects are carried out by subject teachers. A teacher is an interpreter and transformer of subject content knowledge to facilitate learners’ learning.⁷³ However, teachers need to be equipped with subject content knowledge if they are to explain and present the content of the accounting subject precisely. The support given to teachers should focus on challenges that the teachers experience and that are revealed during teachers’ meetings regarding subject content knowledge.⁷⁴ Determining the extent of the problems should be approached with meticulous care.⁷⁵ This means that the level of detail and specifics regarding specific concepts and topics need to be clarified.⁷⁶ In other words, the teachers’ problems must be diagnosed precisely, and thus the diagnosis of teachers’ content deficiencies must be addressed cognizant of professional development strategies informed by EMS teachers to design an appropriate intervention program and to develop training material that is responsive to respective teaching needs.⁷⁷ The implementation of these mechanisms and strategies needs to be monitored, enhanced, and implemented in forms and formats that seek to address outstanding and newly identified challenges.⁷⁸ The extent to which these improvement mechanisms enhance learning should form the

⁷¹ Steyn, “Educators’ Perceptions of Continuing Professional Development for Teachers in South Africa: A Qualitative Study.”

⁷² Habasisa Vincent Molise, “Exploring the Content Knowledge of Accounting Teachers in Rural Contexts: A Call for a Decoloniality Approach,” *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 19, no. 8 (August 30, 2020): 447–58, <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.8.24>.

⁷³ Lee S Shulman, “Those Who Understand: A Conception of Teacher Knowledge.,” *American Educator* 10, no. 1 (1986), 333.

⁷⁴ Micheal M van Wyk, “Exploring Collective Learning Conversations in Economics Education: A Social Change Narrative Inquiry Approach.,” *Journal of Social Sciences* 43, no. 1 (2015): 71–80; Ngwenya, “Accounting Teachers’ Understandings and Practices of Teaching and Assessment in a Context of Curriculum Change”; Adu, Duku, and Adu, “Role of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD) on Teachers’ and Learners’ Achievement in South Africa: A Literature Review.”

⁷⁵ Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, “Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province”; Lessing and De Witt, “The Value of Continuous Professional Development: Teachers’ Perceptions.”

⁷⁶ Jabulisile C. Ngwenya and Suriumurthee M. Maistry, “Teaching and Assessment in Accounting: An Exploration of Teachers’ Experiences in a Rural KwaZulu-Natal School,” *Journal of Social Sciences* 33, no. 1 (October 9, 2012): 21–30, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09718923.2012.11893083>.

⁷⁷ Molebatsi Milton Nkoane, “The Africanisation of the University in Africa,” *Alternation* 13, no. 1 (2006): 49–69.

⁷⁸ A Murugan and L Rajoo, “Students’ Perceptions of Mathematics Classroom Environment and Mathematics Achievement: A Study in Sipitang, Sabah, Malaysia,” in *International Conference on Social Science Research, Penang, Malaysia*, 2013; Tshelane and

basis of their development and further consideration.⁷⁹ This study has established that there is a considerable need to include EMS content-specific realities during teacher development and support sessions. These topics should include accounting concepts, the accounting equation, and subsidiary journals. Furthermore, an earnest attempt must be made to help teachers consider how each problem diagnosed is related to or is a result of one or a combination of the following shortcomings: understanding of accounting concepts, analysis of transactions in the accounting equation, recording of transactions in the subsidiary journals, and drafting of final accounts. In light of the findings and analysis that flow through this study, the continuous professional development of teachers needs to be taken seriously. The issue of human relations where teachers' professional development is realistically contextualized seems more necessary, as discussed by Dube and Jita.⁸⁰ These scholars corroborate what Draz and Ahmad said when they argued that CPTD needs to invest in school relations through research in EMS teachers, and subject advisors, and carefully navigate tensions that continually surface.⁸¹ Similar to Barnawi, this study holds and encourages the view that human relationships, when offering professional development to teachers, give an opportunity for teachers to admire their careers and desire to do more.⁸² According to Branson and Marra, rethinking healthy school relationships within the lens of RL offers a good opportunity for positive change that improves human conditions and does not intentionally harm others.⁸³ Therefore, this study aims at the emancipation of all teachers from professional underdevelopment and non-involvement in CPTD programs' preparation.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the findings and the discussion, the following may be recommended; (a) there must be ways invented to develop healthy school relationships during the professional development of EMS teachers, (b) mentorship of teachers by their subject advisors should be taken seriously as a mandatory exercise, (c) Development of teachers must take into account the real contextual challenges than being general, (d) CPTD programs must have a follow-up system that will ensure that the professional development of teachers happens as a process than merely an event, (e) knowledge of the subject content must be understood as the core on which CPTD must strongly focus. In summary, this study advocates the creation of relationships and mentoring between experienced teachers and newly qualified teachers.

CONCLUSION

This study has revealed detailed specifics about the challenges experienced by teachers in their professional development. The current format of CPTD has been discussed as not effective as it is kind of a workshop that comes as a once-off event with no relation to real teachers' context. A detailed analysis of the findings shows that fewer efforts are being made to forge healthy relationships between teachers and their subject advisors, who should be giving proper mentoring towards the professional development of teachers. Within this study, literature has shown that, to some extent, the implementation of CPTD programs has been unsatisfactory and inconsiderate of teachers, who are the direct parties in the implementation of the subject (EMS) curriculum in schools. Among other important elements, this study has substantively explained the adoption of RL as a theoretical framework that promises to accommodate everyone and create everyone's own ownership of good developmental results. By far, this study indicates that the solution to the problem of ineffective CPTD programs can be found through the inclusion of teachers in the planning and follow-up mechanisms to enhance teachers' development in terms of the content knowledge of the subject EMS. In terms of literature, this study shows that the complaint about the implementation of CPTD has long been in existence, and that says something about the lack of desire to change in the district management of education. In its entirety, this study has taken into consideration all the relevant views from a teacher's perspective about the improper implementation of CPTD in South Africa.

Mahlomaholo, "Creating Sustainable Learning Environments for Professional Curriculum Leadership through Information and Communication Technologies."

⁷⁹ Draz and Ahmad, "Continuing Professional Development and Accounting Academics: A Literature Review"; Ngwenya, "Accounting Teachers' Understandings and Practices of Teaching and Assessment in a Context of Curriculum Change."

⁸⁰ Dube and Jita, "Rethinking Healthy School Relations for Curriculum Change in Zimbabwe: A Relational Leadership Approach."

⁸¹ Draz and Ahmad, "Continuing Professional Development and Accounting Academics: A Literature Review."

⁸² Barnawi, "Dialogic Investigations of Teacher-Supervisor Relations in the TESOL Landscape."

⁸³ Christopher M. Branson and Maureen Marra, "Leadership as a Relational Phenomenon: What This Means in Practice," *Research in Educational Administration & Leadership* 4, no. 1 (July 15, 2019): 81-108, <https://doi.org/10.30828/real/2019.1.4>.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Adeleye, Olatunji John. "Pedagogical Challenges on the Effectiveness of Business Studies Teachers in Junior Secondary Schools, Oyo State." *International Journal of Advanced Academic Research* 3, no. 3 (2017): 32–46.
- Adu, Kemi O, N Duku, and Emmanuel Olusola Adu. "Role of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD) on Teachers' and Learners' Achievement in South Africa: A Literature Review." *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science (2147- 4478)* 12, no. 7 (October 28, 2023): 542–48. <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v12i7.2799>.
- Akram, Tayyaba, Shen Lei, and Muhammad Jamal Haider. "The Impact of Relational Leadership on Employee Innovative Work Behavior in IT Industry of China." *Arab Economic and Business Journal* 11, no. 2 (December 2016): 153–61. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aebj.2016.06.001>.
- Badri, Masood, Ali Alnuaimi, Jihad Mohaidat, Guang Yang, and Asma Al Rashedi. "Perception of Teachers' Professional Development Needs, Impacts, and Barriers." *SAGE Open* 6, no. 3 (July 8, 2016): 215824401666290. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2158244016662901>.
- Barnawi, Osman Z. "Dialogic Investigations of Teacher–Supervisor Relations in the TESOL Landscape." *Cogent Education* 3, no. 1 (December 31, 2016): 1217818. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2016.1217818>.
- Branson, Christopher M., and Maureen Marra. "Leadership as a Relational Phenomenon: What This Means in Practice." *Research in Educational Administration & Leadership* 4, no. 1 (July 15, 2019): 81–108. <https://doi.org/10.30828/real/2019.1.4>.
- Bubb, Sara, and Peter Earley. "Leading Staff Development for School Improvement." *School Leadership & Management* 29, no. 1 (February 2009): 23–37. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13632430802646370>.
- Campbell, Louise. "Pedagogical Bricolage and Teacher Agency: Towards a Culture of Creative Professionalism." *Educational Philosophy and Theory* 51, no. 1 (January 2, 2019): 31–40. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131857.2018.1425992>.
- Dasoo, N. "Teacher Advocacy for the Enhancement of Professional Learning and Development in Continuous Professional Teacher Development Programmes." *South African Journal of Higher Education* 34, no. 4 (September 2020). <https://doi.org/10.20853/34-4-3485>.
- Derakhshan, Ali, Christine Coombe, Kiyana Zhaleh, and Maryamsadat Tabatabaeian. "Examining the Roles of Continuing Professional Development Needs and Views of Research in English Language Teachers' Success." *Test-Ej* 24, no. 3 (2020): n3.
- Dogan, Selcuk, Rose Pringle, and Jennifer Mesa. "The Impacts of Professional Learning Communities on Science Teachers' Knowledge, Practice and Student Learning: A Review." *Professional Development in Education* 42, no. 4 (August 7, 2016): 569–88. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2015.1065899>.
- Draz, Muhammad Umar, and Fayyaz Ahmad. "Continuing Professional Development and Accounting Academics: A Literature Review." *International Journal of Learning and Development* 7, no. 4 (2017): 44–52.
- Dube, Bekithemba, and Thuthukile Jita. "Rethinking Healthy School Relations for Curriculum Change in Zimbabwe: A Relational Leadership Approach." *Issues in Educational Research* 28, no.4(2018):901–17.
- Duncan, Heather, Bret Range, and Susan Scherz. "From Professional Preparation to On-the-Job Development: What Do Beginning Principals Need?." *International Journal of Educational Leadership Preparation* 6, no. 3 (2011): n3.
- Fischer, Christian, Barry Fishman, Chris Dede, Arthur Eisenkraft, Kim Frumin, Brandon Foster, Frances Lawrenz, Abigail Jurist Levy, and Ayana McCoy. "Investigating Relationships between School Context, Teacher Professional Development, Teaching Practices, and Student Achievement in Response to a Nationwide Science Reform." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 72 (2018): 107–21.
- Fouché, J.P. "A Renewed Call for Change in Accounting Education Practices." *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 5, no. 2 (April 25, 2013): 137–50. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09751122.2013.11890071>.
- García-Moya, Irene, Carmen Moreno, and Fiona M. Brooks. "The 'Balancing Acts' of Building Positive Relationships with Students: Secondary School Teachers' Perspectives in England and Spain." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 86 (November 2019): 102883. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2019.102883>.
- Georgina Kedibone Bernadine, Gomba. "Challenges Faced by Educators in the Implementation of Continuing Professional Teacher Development (CPTD): Gauteng Province." In *Teacher Education in the 21st Century*. IntechOpen, 2019. <https://doi.org/10.5772/intechopen.84836>.
- Gowing, Annie. "Peer-Peer Relationships: A Key Factor in Enhancing School Connectedness and Belonging." *Educational and Child Psychology* 36, no. 2 (2019): 64–77.

- Gray, Tonia, and Greg Downey. "Incorporating Participatory Action Research and Social Media as a Research Tool Whilst Gen-Y Studies Abroad." In *The Globalisation of Higher Education*, 197–216. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-74579-4_12.
- Green, Alison, and Judith Kearney. "Participatory Action Learning and Action Research for Self-Sustaining Community Development: Engaging Pacific Islanders in Southeast Queensland." *The Australasian Journal of University-Community Engagement* 6, no. 1 (2011): 46–68.
- Hangeior, Apollonia A, Iorbee Fidelis Ighag, and Umogbai Monica Esiebugie. "Effect of Relational Leadership on Organizational Effectiveness in the Nigerian Public Sector: A Study of Power Holding Company of Nigeria." *Imperial Journal of Interdisciplinary Research* 2, no. 8 (2016): 1326–32.
- Hismanoglu, Murat, and Sibel Hismanoglu. "English Language Teachers' Perceptions of Educational Supervision in Relation to Their Professional Environment: A Case Study of Northern Cyprus." *Novitas-ROYAL (Research on Youth and Language)* 4, no. 1 (2010).
- Kincheloe, Joe L. "Critical Complexity and Participatory Action Research: Decolonizing 'Democratic' Knowledge Production." In *Education, Participatory Action Research, and Social Change: International Perspectives*, 107–21. Springer, 2009.
- Klink, Marcel Van der, Quinta Kools, Gilada Avissar, Simone White, and Tetsuhito Sakata. "Professional Development of Teacher Educators: What Do They Do? Findings from an Explorative International Study." *Professional Development in Education* 43, no. 2 (March 15, 2017): 163–78. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19415257.2015.1114506>.
- Lessing, Ansie, and Marike De Witt. "The Value of Continuous Professional Development: Teachers' Perceptions." *South African Journal of Education* 27, no. 1 (2007): 53–67.
- Modise, Alfred Motalenyane. "Pedagogical Content Knowledge Challenges of Accounting Teachers." *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 13, no. 3 (2016): 291–97.
- Mokgosi, Patricia, Thelma De Jager, and Toy White. "Lesson Study: Collaborative Enhancement of Economic and Management Sciences (EMS) Teachers' Classroom Practices." *Journal of Educational Studies* 17, no. 1 (2018): 94–114.
- Molise, Habasisa, and Bekithemba Dube. "Emergency Online Teaching in Economic and Management Sciences Necessitated by the COVID-19 Pandemic: The Need for Healthy Relations in a Rural Schooling Context." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 19, no. 6 (2020): 387–400.
- Molise, Habasisa Vincent. "Exploring the Content Knowledge of Accounting Teachers in Rural Contexts: A Call for a Decoloniality Approach." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 19, no. 8 (August 30, 2020): 447–58. <https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.19.8.24>.
- Moloi, Tankiso. "Analysing the Human Capital Capabilities in the Enterprise Risk Management Function of South Africa's Public Institutions." *Business and Economic Horizons* 14, no. 2 (2018): 375–88. <https://doi.org/10.15208/beh.2018.27>.
- Mosia, Moeketsi Simon. "Periodisation of Mathematics Teacher Knowledge for Teaching: A Construction of Bricolage." *Southern African Review of Education with Education with Production* 22, no. 1 (2016): 134–51.
- Mukeredzi, Tabitha Grace. "Professional Development through Teacher Roles: Conceptions of Professionally Unqualified Teachers in Rural South Africa and Zimbabwe." *Journal of Research in Rural Education* 28, no. 11 (2013): 1–16.
- Murugan, A, and L Rajoo. "Students' Perceptions of Mathematics Classroom Environment and Mathematics Achievement: A Study in Sipitang, Sabah, Malaysia." In *International Conference on Social Science Research, Penang, Malaysia*, 2013.
- Ngwenya, Jabulisile C., and Suriamurthee M. Maistry. "Teaching and Assessment in Accounting: An Exploration of Teachers' Experiences in a Rural KwaZulu-Natal School." *Journal of Social Sciences* 33, no. 1 (October 9, 2012): 21–30. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09718923.2012.11893083>.
- Ngwenya, Jabulisile C., and Siyacela Nzuzi. "Teachers' Views on the Role of Economic and Management Sciences in Preparing Learners for Accounting in the Further Education and Training Phase." *South African Journal of Education* 42, no. 4 (November 30, 2022): 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v42n4a2131>.
- Ngwenya, Jabulisile C. "Accounting Teachers' Understandings and Practices of Teaching and Assessment in a Context of Curriculum Change." *Alternation* 21, no. 1 (2014): 171–89.
- Njenga, Moses. "Teacher Participation in Continuing Professional Development: A Theoretical Framework." *Journal of Adult and Continuing Education* 29, no. 1 (May 1, 2023): 69–85. <https://doi.org/10.1177/14779714221123603>.

- Nkoane, Molebatsi Milton. "The Africanisation of the University in Africa." *Alternation* 13, no.1(2006):49–69.
- Omodan, Bunmi. "Democratic Pedagogy in South Africa: A Rethinking Viewpoint for Knowledge Construction." *Journal of Social Studies Education Research* 10, no. 2 (2019): 188–203.
- Ono, Yumiko, and Johanna Ferreira. "A Case Study of Continuing Teacher Professional Development through Lesson Study in South Africa." *South African Journal of Education* 30, no. 1 (March 4, 2010): 59–74. <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v30n1a320>.
- Ravhuhali, F, A P Kutame, and H N Mutshaeni. "Teachers' Perceptions of the Impact of Continuing Professional Development on Promoting Quality Teaching and Learning." *International Journal of Educational Sciences* 10, no. 1 (2015): 1–7.
- Raynor, Katrina. "Participatory Action Research and Early Career Researchers: The Structural Barriers to Engagement and Why We Should Do It Anyway." *Planning Theory & Practice* 20, no. 1 (January 11, 2019): 130–36. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14649357.2018.1556501>.
- Ruslin, Ruslin, Saepudin Mashuri, Muhammad Sarib Abdul Rasak, Firdiansyah Alhabsyi, and Hijrah Syam. "Semi-Structured Interview: A Methodological Reflection on the Development of a Qualitative Research Instrument in Educational Studies." *IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education (IOSR-JRME)* 12, no. 1 (2022): 22–29.
- Sakketa, Tekalign Gutu. "Institutional Bricolage as a New Perspective to Analyse Institutions of Communal Irrigation: Implications towards Meeting the Water Needs of the Poor Communities." *World Development Perspectives* 9 (2018): 1–11.
- Shulman, Lee S. "Those Who Understand: A Conception of Teacher Knowledge." *American Educator* 10, no. 1 (1986).
- Smit, Brigitte. "Expanding Educational Leadership Theories through Qualitative Relational Methodologies." *Magis, Revista Internacional de Investigación En Educación* 11, no. 22 (October 16, 2018): 75–86. <https://doi.org/10.11144/Javeriana.m11-22.eelt>.
- Steyn, G. M. "Educators' Perceptions of Continuing Professional Development for Teachers in South Africa: A Qualitative Study." *Africa Education Review* 7, no. 1 (June 2010): 156–79. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18146627.2010.490009>.
- Tshelane, Molaodi, and Sechaba Mahlomaholo. "Creating Sustainable Learning Environments for Professional Curriculum Leadership through Information and Communication Technologies." *Journal of Higher Education in Africa/Revue de l'enseignement Supérieur En Afrique* 13, no. 1–2 (2015): 193–212.
- Vangrieken, Katrien, Chloé Meredith, Tlalit Packer, and Eva Kyndt. "Teacher Communities as a Context for Professional Development: A Systematic Review." *Teaching and Teacher Education* 61 (January 2017): 47–59. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tate.2016.10.001>.
- Wessels, Elsabé, and Lesley Wood. "Fostering Teachers' Experiences of Well-Being: A Participatory Action Learning and Action Research Approach." *South African Journal of Education* 39, no. 1 (2019).
- Wong, Hin Chow, Subramaniam Sri Ramalu, and Francis Chuah. "An Overview of Leadership and the Emerging of Relational Leadership." *Journal of Human Resource and Leadership* 4, no.1 (2019): 32–43.
- Wyk, Micheal M van. "Exploring Collective Learning Conversations in Economics Education: A Social Change Narrative Inquiry Approach." *Journal of Social Sciences* 43, no. 1 (2015): 71–80.
- Zhang, Xianchun, and Zhu Yao. "Impact of Relational Leadership on Employees' Unethical pro-Organizational Behavior: A Survey Based on Tourism Companies in Four Countries." *PLOS ONE* 14, no. 12 (December 9, 2019): e0225706. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0225706>.

ABOUT AUTHORS

Habasisa Molise (PhD Student) is a Lecturer: School of Education, Department of Education Studies at the University of Limpopo, South Africa. He holds a Master's Degree in Curriculum Studies. His research interests focus on Commerce Education.

Malose Kola is an Associate Professor: School of Education, Department of Education Studies at the University of Limpopo, South Africa. He holds a PhD in Education Studies. His research interests focus on Technology Education.

Mohammed Xolile Ntshangase (PhD Student) is a Lecturer: School of Education, Department of Education Studies at the University of Limpopo, South Africa. He holds a Master's Degree in Philosophy of Education. His research interests focus on African Philosophy.